



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	2014_BJAST_12886
Title of the Manuscript:	REPLACEMENT OF FISH MEAL WITH BAMBARANUT WASTE MEAL IN THE DIETS OF LARVAL AFRICAN CATFISH <i>CLARIAS GARIEPINUS</i> BURCHELL (1822)
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Line 9. High cost of fishmeal adversely affects production of African catfish.... Line 9. High cost of fishmeal adversely affects production growth performance) of African catfish.... Lines 42-43. African catfish is omnivorous and in addition possesses fast growth, hardiness 44 and high fecundity and commands good market prices.... Lines 42-43. African catfish is omnivorous and in addition possesses fast growth, hardiness 44 and high fecundity and commands good market prices.... Lines 48-50. Generally growth and intensification of aquaculture production also depends on development of sustainable protein source, to replace fish meal in aqua diets like plant protein.... Lines 48-50. Generally growth and intensification of aquaculture production also depends on development of sustainable protein source, to replace fish meal in aquafeeds diets like plant protein.. Page 6. Line 120. treatment feed in this research. Weighing balance sensitive to 0.01g was used in weighing. Page 6. Line 120. treatment feed in this research. Weighing balance sensitive to 0.01g was used. Line 120. Length measurements were done per fish for the entire replicate tank Lines 143-146- DATA ANALYSIS One way ANOVA was used in calculating treatment and block effects and Fishers least Significant difference (FLSD 0.05) was used in separating	Noted and effected Noted and effected Noted and effected



SDI Review Form 1.6

	treatment means. Analysis were done with Spss statistical package v.14 (Considering quantitative data and dependent and independent variables, all parameters should be evaluated as linear or second-order (quadratic) regression analysis.). Since, all data were compared by Fisher's test. At least, weight gain and SGR should analyze as regression analysis. Line 153 – Length gain is not an usual parameter to evaluate growth performance of fish. Please, remove this variable because there are already data of weight gain and SGR. ****Please, insert statistical analysis at the end of material and methods. Line 155. Do not use % of weight gain as variable because SGR is a standard variable in fish nutrition study Line 162. Insert data of water parameters evaluated in the present study (show as mean $\pm$ DS or SE) Line 183. Look at table 2 results (no results on FCR), FCR of fish was affected by dietary treatments. 288. Do not show results as conclusion, be incisive and follow objectives to write conclusion(s). ***Authors should use bambaranut waste meal levels to express parameters variables besides of F1, F2,...etc, even in tables. ****If possible, insert data of babaranut waste meal composition in the methodology. ***Table 1. Use bambaranut waste meal inclusion as variable despite of F1, F2,.....; Follow this rule for all tables. Table 1. Insert AWG and SGR befor FCR data.	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Competing interest Yes, for mass fish production evaluating fish meal substitution is important to produce economical diets once fish meal is costly. All information's described in this article may be used to produce economical available diets for the referenced fish species, and contributing for economical and social development by producing high protein, energy, vitamin and mineral source of food. However, some suggestions were described and must be considered.	Ok ok
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	ethical issues -: Informations on fish euthanasia, anaesthesia or ethics were not considered in this article.	Yes but we weighed fish alive.