



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	2014_BJAST_13115
Title of the Manuscript:	Sum Rate Maximization Based on Joint Power Control and Beamforming in MIMO One Way AF Relay Networks
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	1. Proof is necessary to include for how convex problem is solved take help from reference 10. 2. Must include the limitation of your proposed algorithm in the conclusion section. 3. Characteristics of uncertainty channel include.	1- Some definitions about CVX and SDP problems are added to this part. Also, it is added that all constraints are in the form of linear and SDR in eq. 27. As it is mentioned in paper, the convex problem is solved by interior point method by CVX Matlab toolbox. As noted by reviewer, we referred to Ref. 10 but there is no proof about how convex problem solved in it. We emphasize that most cvx users do not need to know how cvx handles their problem, what matters is that what functions and operations can be handled. 2- We explain the limitation of proposed algorithm (By solving the optimization problem (25).... from which the best solution will be selected---below eq-25). It is added in conclusion part that "when $d > 3$ we should use randomization technique to find suboptimum beamforming". Also, "in this paper we assume that the second order statistics of the channel coefficients (rather than their instantaneous values) are available. Because CSI is not available in a real communication system due to limited feedback and/or inaccurate channel estimation, so robust designs can be considered in the case of imperfect CSI". 3- We believe that it is clear in section 3-5.



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	1. Make introduction section short keeping only the related topic. 2. Elaborate how convex optimization tool useful or helpful to solve optimization issue.	1-Lines 16-22, 37, 63-69 became deleted. Also, lines 52-58 were changed. 2- Descriptions after equation. 27 show it.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	1. The next work or further work includes it in the future scope. competing interest -YES	1- It is done.