



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">British Journal of Applied Science &amp; Technology</a>                                                            |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_BJAST_13587                                                                                                               |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Cytotoxic, antioxidant and antimicrobial activity of aqueous and alcoholic extracts of <i>Annona muricata</i> L. seed and pulp |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                                      |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p><b>Title:</b> needs to be restructured as : An <i>iv-vitro</i> analysis of the -----</p> <p><b>Abstract:</b> in the methodology the extract names should be labelled separately as methanol extract of--- like which is used in the text. Results are slightly vague and should be clearly indicated. <i>Salmonella enteritidis</i> should be small letter: wherever it is used. Conclusion –which specific compounds: needs to be replaced by isolation and characterisation of the specific compounds.</p> <p><b>Introduction:</b> your justification needs to be stronger<br/>because the anticancer activity of <i>A. muricata</i> was done extensively in many other aspects.</p> <p><b>Materials and methods:</b> The extract preparations described here are not giving the full picture of the preparation and the names used. Name them according to the methods used. These abbreviations should be used in the results without mixing up. Again how many of these extracts were prepared from the pulp? Specify.</p> <p><b>Results and discussion:</b> When you use, seed and pulp, it is not clear. Specify which one. I hope the fibroblasts were used as control, indicate that in your results. The graphs are giving the same results as the tables, so there is no need of both</p> | <p>1) <b>Title:</b> needs to be restructured as : An <i>iv-vitro</i> analysis of the -----<br/>A: This was re-structured</p> <p>2) <b>Abstract:</b> in the methodology the extract names should be labelled separately as methanol extract of--- like which is used in the text. Results are slightly vague and should be clearly indicated. <i>Salmonella enteritidis</i> should be small letter: wherever it is used. Conclusion –which specific compounds: needs to be replaced by isolation and characterisation of the specific compounds.<br/>A: The extract names were labelled as the text and nomenclature was kept (lines 15-16 of the revised version). Results were enhanced adding data. Enteritidis is not a specie, it is a serovar, therefore the first letter is capitalized and is not cursive. In conclusion the statement was corrected as suggested by you</p> <p>3) <b>Introduction:</b> your justification needs to be stronger because the anticancer activity of <i>A. muricata</i> was done extensively in many other aspects.<br/>A: In spite of the done studies about anticancer activity of <i>Annona muricata</i>, few studies on the cytotoxic, antimicrobial and antioxidant activity of the <i>Annona muricata</i> L. part that is really consumed (pulp) have been carried out. This is justified in lines 64-66 of the revised version.</p> <p>4) <b>Materials and methods:</b> The extract preparations described here are not giving the full picture of the</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|--|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>these data. Select one of the two.<br/>In Table -2 did you use the fibroblasts as control? It is not indicated. In the last paragraph also include the antioxidant potential of these extracts to control the cancer.<br/>Conclusions: you do not have to summarize the results but conclude with your findings.<br/>Restructure</p> <p>References: Try to be uniform, follow the guidelines.(line 343: the scientific names in italics)</p> | <p>preparation and the names used. Name them according to the methods used. These abbreviations should be used in the results without mixing up. Again how many of these extracts were prepared from the pulp? Specify.<br/>A: Names of all extracts were accordingly labelled (Lines 84, 91, 94 of the revised version). Only one extract was prepared from the pulp (by the decoction method) this is indicated in the methodology.</p> <p>5) Results and discussion: When you use, seed and pulp, it is not clear. Specify which one. I hope the fibroblasts were used as control, indicate that in your results. The graphs are giving the same results as the tables, so there is no need of both these data. Select one of the two.<br/>A: These were corrected for better understanding (Lines 193, 209). The use of fibroblasts as a control was indicated in the methodology, results and tables as indicated by you (lines 105, 194-195, 205-206, 232-233). Table 1 was selected and graphic was eliminated</p> <p>6) In Table -2 did you use the fibroblasts as control? It is not indicated. In the last paragraph also include the antioxidant potential of these extracts to control the cancer<br/>A: Fibroblasts were used as reference to determine the selective effect on the tumor cells. This statement was included in the legend of the Table 2. The selectivity index (SI) was calculated as the <math>IC_{50}</math> (control cells)/<math>IC_{50}</math> (tumor cell line) ratio, as indicated in the point 2.7 of M&amp;M.</p> <p>7) Conclusions: you do not have to summarize the results but conclude with your findings. Restructure<br/>A: This was re-structured</p> <p>8) References: Try to be uniform, follow the guidelines.(line</p> |
|--|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|--------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | <b>343: the scientific names in italics)</b><br><b>A:</b> These were corrected                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION<br>comments   | Please check all the <b>scientific names</b> and correct them.<br>Check the spacing<br>The word <i>et. al.</i> follow the guidelines.<br>The seeds of soursop: Are they edible? IF NOT. What is your recommendation?                                                                                                                                                                | <b>a) Please check all the scientific names and correct them.</b><br><b>A:</b> These were checked and corrected<br><br><b>b) Check the spacing</b><br><b>A:</b> These were checked<br><br><b>c) The word <i>et. al.</i> follow the guidelines.</b><br><b>A:</b> The Author's Instructions and last publications indicate that the word "et al." should be written in small letter without cursive.<br><br><b>d) The seeds of soursop: Are they edible? IF NOT. What is your recommendation?</b><br><b>A:</b> The soursop seeds are not edible, but the soursop seed extracts could be used to produce medicinal capsules like in the case of grape seed extract or might be incorporated in the food through edible coating. |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b><br>comments | <b>The paper has much valuable information which can be useful to the community and alternative medicine. They used many references from old to the latest which could help and support the findings.</b><br><b>The paper can be accepted for publication only after: clarification of the extract preparation and labeling , proper editing and corrections as mentioned above</b> | All comments done and remarked by you in the paper annexed with change control were taken in account.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |