



SDI Review Form 1.5

PART A:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012/BJAST/1572
Title of the Manuscript:	<i>DETERMINATION OF MINERAL COMPOSITION, ANTI-MICROBIAL ACTIVITY AND ANTI-NUTRIENT SCREENING OF Cleome gynandra (CAT'S WHISKERS).</i>
Manuscript received on (Date)	
Review comment submitted (Date)	



SDI Review Form 1.5

PART B: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part and write here 'Corrected'/ if not agreed, give suitable justifications)
General comment:	This manuscript described the determination of mineral composition, anti-microbial activity and anti-nutrient analysis from different tissues of <i>Cleome gynandra</i>, and found that Na, Ca, Mg, and Fe were detected whereas some toxic heavy metals such as Zn, Mn, Cr, Cu and Pb were not detected in the samples from leaves, stems and roots. Anti-microbial activity showed moderate inhibitory zone for the microorganisms examined, and anti-nutrient analysis showed that phytate and oxalate were present in small amounts while tannins were not detected or in traces. Overall, it is an original work, and provides useful information for the use of <i>C. gynandra</i> as a source of vegetable and folk medicine in Africa countries. However, before it is accepted for publication, some data scientifically appear still quite preliminary and require careful reconsideration: 1. What is the growth stage of <i>C. gynandra</i>? Did the plant contain flowers and seeds? What are the analytical results for these tissues? 2. Figure 1. How many experiments were done in this experiment? Only one? 3. Legends in Figure 1, table 1 and Table 2 are not acceptable. Please rewrite these legends. 4. Line 27. The subtitle "RESULTS" should be deleted, since no descriptions were found in this section. 5. Line 164. The subtitle "DISCUSSION" should be changed into "RESULTS and DISCUSSION".	1. Plant was harvested with matured flowers and the results presented were what we obtained. 2. All experiments were carried out in triplicates. 3. Corrected 4. Corrected 5. Corrected. 6. Aim of the research was not to use the plant for heavy metal – remediation, but to find-out whether the heavy & harmful metals could accumulate in the plant and cause harm to human since this plant is consumed by man



SDI Review Form 1.5

	6. Line 166. "<i>Cleome gynandra</i> is a good source of Ca, Mg, Na and Fe..." Concentrations of metals examined in this study wer less than 5 ppm, especially less than 2.5 ppm of Fe, I just wonder whether <i>C. gynandra</i> is a good source for uptaking sufficient metals. 7. Line 172. Some words at the last sentence were missing. 8. Line 191. Please confirm the statement "Deficiency of Cu..." is correct, and delete the comment "[I don't know, are you referring to CU here]". Please check carefully before submission of the manuscript. 9. Many mistakes/typing errors were found in the text. For examples, The Samples contained ...(line 6); ...communities [7, 8]. and Many...(line 34); Cat's whakers whiskers...(line 41); 2.0 g of each sample each was dissolved in 100 ml of 1.5 NH₂SO₄ N H₂SO₄ ...(line 116); 0.1% Ferrie ferric acid... (line 123). Please check very careful before submission of the manuscript. 10. Line 236. No page numbers were missing in this reference. 11. Line 261. Title of this reference was missing. 12. Please check the style in the reference section to see whether it fits the format of the journal.	7.Corrected 8. Corrected 9.Corrected 10.Corrected 11. Corrected 12.Corrected
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.5

Specific comments:		
Title and abstract		
Introduction		
Review of literature (Heading may differ in the case of review paper)		
Materials & methods (Heading may differ in the case of review paper)		
Results & discussion (Heading may differ in the case of review paper)		
Conclusion		
References		