



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012/BJAST/1572
Title of the Manuscript:	DETERMINATION OF MINERAL COMPOSITION, ANTI-MICROBIAL ACTIVITY AND ANTI-NUTRIENT SCREENING OF <i>Cleome gynandra</i> (CAT'S WHISKERS).

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The revised manuscript (MS) didn't address key points questioned in the previous review comment, and the manuscript didn't bring any advancements in the understanding of the mineral composition of the target plant, <i>Cleome gynandra</i> L in comparison with already reported works such as Van der Walt AM et al., 2009, literatures in the review of Mishra SS et al 2011(Review on <i>Cleome Gynandra</i>. IJRPC, 1(3): 681-689). In the work of van der Walt AM et al.(2009), the mineral composition of <i>Cleome gynandra</i> of different regions was determined using an Agilent 7500c inductively coupled argon plasma mass spectrometer (ICP-MS), and the foliar content of Ca, Mg, Fe, Zn and Se was reported. More mineral components and content were summarized in Mishra SS's review (2011), such as K, Ca, Mg, Na, P, Fe, Zn and Cu. From this concern, the MS has little scientific significance. The MS claimed only presence of Ca, Na, Mg and Fe in the (95%) ethanol fraction of the leaf, stem and roots of <i>Cleome gynandra</i>. (Cat's whiskers) when determined with Atomic Absorption Spectrometer (AAS) Bulk 210 model. Why the (95%) ethanol fraction was used for mineral determination? (Methods can be seen in van der Walt AM et al. 2009, S Afr J Sci, 105: 444-448; Pillai LS and Nair BR 2013, Int'l J Pharmacy Pharmaceutical Sci, 5(1): 384-387). The MS claimed "Results of Mineral constituents; concentration in (ppm), all concentrations are results of triplicates) (Fig. 1), but no SD bar was given in the figure. The presentation of MS is poor, and in particular in the list of references. In the main text, the problem of lacking one space between number and unit remained although it was indicated in the previous review comment. The list of reference lacks consistency, including but not limited to, with or without title, captain or lowercase of the titles etc. In addition, some key references should be cited, for example: Anbazhagi T at al. 2009 Studies on the pharmacognostical and in vitro antioxidant potential of <i>Cleome gynandra</i> Linn. Leaves. Nat Prod. Radiance. 8(2): 151-157 Chweya JA and Mnzava NA. IPGRI International Plant Genetic Resources Institute IPGRI, Promoting the conservation and use of underutilized and neglected crops. 11. Cat's whiskers. Chipurura B et al. An assessment of the phenolic content, composition and antioxidant	Our work did not cite or reference that of Van der Walt AM <i>et al</i>, 2009, because we did not use their work, and we were not comparing minerals found in <i>C gynandra</i> with what they got. We only did research with the plants we have in our environment and reported the results we got. More so, the machines we both used were not the same and the identification patterns and efficacies obviously will not be same. We cited other works and we do not know why the editor is very particular about the adjacent cited authors. Our interest was to show the world how pure our ethanol was, such that contamination could not have come from the solvent. Yes, all experiments were carried out in triplicates and we only showed the concentrations of the minerals using bar charts We have been able to revise the manuscript and some relevant references added. Thanks for the suggestion but not all the references are needful or this work



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

capacity of Bidens Pilosa, Cleome Gynandra, Corchorus Olitorius, Galinsoga Parviflora and Amaranthus Hybridus. ISHS Acta Hort, 911

Gao ZJ et al. 2011. Purification and characterisation of polyphenol oxidase from leaves of Cleome gynandra L. Food Chem, 129 (3): 1012-1018

Gupta PC and Rao CV, 2012 Pharmacognostical studies of Cleome Viscosa Linn. India J Nat Prod Res, 3(4): 527-534

[Mishra SS et al 2011. Review on Cleome Gynandra. IJRPC, 1\(3\): 681-689](#)

Murganantan G et al, 2012 Antimicrobial constituents from plants. IRJP, 3(1): 5-9

Narendhirakannan RT et al. 2005, Anti-inflammatory activity of Cleome Gynandra L. on hematological and cellular constituents in adjuvant-induced arthritic rats. J Med Food. 8(1): 93-9.

Ojiako OA and Igwe CU. 2007 Nutritional and anti-nutritional compositions of Cleome rutidosperma, Lagenaria siceraria, and Cucurbita maxima seeds from Nigeria. J Med Food. 10(4): 735-738.

Schonfeldt HC, Pretorius B, 2011. The nutrient content of five traditional South African dark green leafy vegetables-A preliminary study. J Food Comp Anal. 24 (8): 1141-1146

van den Heever E and Venter SL. Nutritional and medicinal properties of Cleome gynandra. ISHS Acta Hort 752

[van der Walt AM et al., 2009 Minerals, trace elements and antioxidant phytochemicals in wild African dark-green leafy vegetables \(morogo\). S Afr J Sci, 105: 444-448](#)