



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	2014_BJAST_14781
Title of the Manuscript:	EEG Feature Extraction in Brain-Mobile Phone Interfaces
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
It is difficult to follow the paper. The quality of the paper needs to be improved. Also, it is very important for the authors to cite sources they used in the paper. -How did the authors select the classification thresholds? -The authors did not discuss how the data were split into training, cross-validation, and testing sets. Were the classification thresholds derived from the training sets and the classification accuracy obtained from the testing sets? -What are the statistical properties of the features? Are they normally distributed? -Other classification algorithms should be considered in this study. Introduction: -The acronym BMI should follow after Brain-machine interface. -The acronym 'EEG' was introduced without any definition. -References are missing. E.g., in Line 19-20, "Among those who worked on the interface", in Line 24-25, "WSD is a quadratic....." -Paragraph 4 is too long. - Methodology -Line 85: "The protocol" refers to which protocol? -Line 89: Replace "girls" and "boys" with "females" and "males" respectively. -Line 90: Please specify the ethics committee that approved your study and the ethics approval number.	- Agreed. The sources used in the paper are cited accordingly - A simple threshold classifier is used in the initial step of analysis. - There was no machine learning algorithm used in the study. The whole data set was classified according to the known results. The amplitude of the features were just compared against a threshold value that is strong enough to make a decision. This is now added in the section "Results and discussion" - The other classification methods such as linear discriminant analysis and support vector machines are planned to be used as a next step Agreed and modified as below - The expansion of BMI is added accordingly - The expansion of EEG is added accordingly - Paragraph is formatted - References are updated Methodology section is updated accordingly - The protocol means the set of procedures used to collect the brain signals - "girls" and "boys" are replaced with "females" and "males" respectively - There were no specific ethical approval number available.