



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_BJAST_19967
Title of the Manuscript:	A Novel 5x5 Edge Detection Operator For Blood Vessel Images
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Because, in our work the objective is to detection the edge in blood vessel images and not blood vessel detection. We compared already with Sobel edge detection. In Introduction Authors wrote: "...detection of blood vessels is most important". Thus I disagree with Authors' response to my request (see above) where I asked for comparison of obtained results to other state-of-the-art methods. Vessel edge detection is only the way to discriminate vessels in retina images and further to estimate some important vessels parameters. Thus I insist to perform such comparison or at least to present and discuss other approaches.	The title of the paper is " A Novel 5x5 Edge Detection Operator For Blood Vessel Images", we mean that the detected edges in retinal images will be used later in another work for blood vessel detection. More explanation: The objective of this work is to detect edges in retinal blood vessel image; this is a pre-processing step for blood vessel detection. The blood vessel detection step takes the edge information and tries to reconstruct the entire blood vessel. In order to show that our results are better than Sobel results, we compare them with the reference images. Figure 4, shows a comparison between our results and Sobel Results with the reference images. As future work, we have to develop another method in order to reconstruct the entire blood vessel from detected edges. Our objective in the paper is to detect the edge in blood vessel images and not blood vessel detection. The blood vessel detection is another work which can publish in another paper. Please take this into consideration. <i>The blood vessel detection step takes the edge information and tries to reconstruct the entire blood vessel.</i> Note that we did an original work and we developed a new mathematical formula for edge detection. We answer to all the comments of the two reviewers. We did a comparison with the reference images. Our objective in the paper is to detect the edge in blood vessel images and not blood vessel detection. The blood vessel detection is another work which can publish in another paper. Please take this into consideration. <i>The blood vessel detection step takes the edge information and tries to reconstruct the entire blood vessel.</i> Note that we did an original work and we developed a new mathematical formula for edge detection.