



**SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1**

**PART 1:**

|                          |                                                                                    |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">British Journal of Mathematics &amp; Computer Science</a>              |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_BJMCS_14611                                                                   |
| Title of the Manuscript: | A Neuronal Classification System for Plant Leaves using Genetic Image Segmentation |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                          |

**PART 2:**

| FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Authors' response to final evaluator's comments                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>1) The manuscript should be improved in terms of technical writing and grammar.</p> <p>2) The use of capital letter. "sobel", "canny", "prewitt" should be "Sobel", "Canny", "Prewitt."</p> <p>3) On page 101, Table 1. Reference [25] has been reported twice in this table, at the first row and at the 8<sup>th</sup> row. Why the descriptions are not the same?</p> <p>4) The last row of Table 1, "Shapes of plants leaves". Does this equivalent to "Geometric features"?</p> <p>5) On page 102, what is <math>\rho</math> in equation (3.1)?</p> <p>6) On page 102, the last line, and also third line of section 4. The citations are not defined (i.e., [?])</p> <p>7) On page 102, equation (4.2). Is "<math>( x_{ij}(t)+1 - x_{ij}(t)-1 )</math>" should be "<math>( x_{ij}(t+1) - x_{ij}(t-1) )</math>"?</p> <p>8) The citation style needs to be updated. Normally, the numbering (also the order in references list) is based on the order they are used/called in text, and not based on the sorting of the authors, name.</p> <p>9) The figure need to be arranged properly, where it should be placed near the paragraph that used it. The numbering should be based on the order they are used in text. (e.g, on page 103,Figure 5 should be changed to become Figure 2, and Figure 7 should be changed to become Figure 3).</p> <p>10) Equation (5.2) should be referred in text. It is only been referred in Table 2, which is not adequate.</p> <p>11) <math>H_x</math> in equation (5.6) is wrong.</p> <p>12) On page 104, 'The best chromosome was obtained at generation 101 as shown in figure 4.' Yet, as shown by figure 4, we can see that the convergence for GA is already achived at 50<sup>th</sup> or 51<sup>st</sup> generation. Why do the authors think that the convergence starts at generation 101? Therefore, more explanation needed.</p> <p>13) On page 106,lastline. "dataset discussed in section ." In which section?</p> <p>14) On page 110,more explanation on Table 4 are needed. "CNN" should be "GA-CNN", which is the proposed method? Furthermore,are data presented here based on the same classification process?</p> <p>15) On page 109,last sentence. "both accuracy and speed of the developed system shown in figure 6.". Yet, figure 6 neither show accuracy nor speed, but just the GUI for the project.</p> | <p>(1) All sections of the paper have been checked and updated as regards technical writing and grammar.</p> <p>(2) The first letters of sobel, canny etc have been made capital case across the sections of the paper.</p> <p>(3) This repetitive reference has been sorted.</p> <p>(4) No! it's just shape-based features. Geometric features are something like area, width etc of the image.</p> <p>(5) The <math>\rho</math> is a radius-based metric</p> <p>(6) The reference missing is now appearing.</p> <p>(7) No! It's correct as it is. The "1" is not added to time "t", rather it is added to x(t).</p> <p>(8) I tried all my latex commands BUT it seems some of the figures just keep moving away from the text. This is one of weakness in latex.</p> <p>(9) The figures addressing have been updated.</p> <p>(10) Equation 5.2 was already refered to in last line of section 5.3</p> <p>(11) The <math>H_x</math> has been corrected properly</p> <p>(12) The GA truly terminated at generation 101 according to my code. The fitness values was the same nearly from generation 50 to generatio 101 and after a series of uniformity in fitness value, the GA will have to terminate. This is proper for GA anywhere, any time.</p> <p>(13) The section intended was 5.1 and it has been updated in the new version.</p> <p>(14) Yes it should be GA-CNN. I have updated this in the paper. Yes the results are based on the same classification process using. This also has been updated in the table caption.</p> <p>(15) This has been changed to Table 4 instead of figure 6</p> |