



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Pharmaceutical Research
Manuscript Number:	2013_BJPR_4857
Title of the Manuscript:	Ameliorative Effects of Alcohol on Human Diabetic Volunteers – A Prospective Study

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p>All my previous comments have been well corrected. A new study group (MDND) has been interestingly added . Unfortunately statistical analysis is confused. For the aim of the study, MDD had to be compared to NDD and MDND to abstainers. In this way we can see the effect of alcohol in diabetics and non diabetics. You use only one symbol, “*” (tab 3) , to indicate “significant variation from NDD and abstainers”. This mean that you compared MDD to both NDD and abstainers?? Or to compare MDD to NDD and MDND to anstainers? More correctly, you should have use different symbols for statistical analysis:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – one symbol to compare MDD to NDD; – one symbol to compare MDND to abstainers; – other symbols for any further comparisons between groups . <p>Using only the symbol “*”, it’s not clear when you compared for example MDND to abstainers and when you compared the same group to NDD. I don’t understand!</p> <p>In your results you had to better discuss table 1. Why BMI is higher in MDD than NDD and in MDND than abstainers?</p> <p>As statistical analysis is confused, your results are not always reported correctly. In line 203 you observe that lipid peroxidation is declined in MDD and MDND than NDD and abstainers. It’s not correct. Membrane lipid peroxidation is lower in MDD when compared to NDD at the contrary to what happens in the 2 non diabetic groups (MDND and abstainers). So alcohol would seem to have an opposite effect in diabetics and in non diabetics! From your results the same conclusion seem true even for fasting serum glucose: it’s higher in NDD than in MDD on the contrary it’s higher in MDND than in abstainers. Your conclusions are incorrect. From your results alcohol seems to improve some cardiovascular risk factors in diabetics but not in non diabetics.</p>	

Note: Anonymous Reviewer