



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Microbiology Research Journal
Manuscript Number:	2013 BMRJ 3513
Title of the Manuscript:	PARASITOLOGICAL EVALUATION OF DOMESTIC WATER SOURCES IN A RURAL COMMUNITY IN NIGERIA

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p>The authors did not make much effort to improve the quality of their manuscript. They have only very partially taken into account my comments.</p> <p>Although it is impossible to morphologically distinguish the eggs/larvae of <i>Strongyloides stercoralis</i> from those of <i>S. ransomi</i> (pigs), the authors kept <i>S. stercoralis</i> in their manuscript instead of <i>Strongyloides</i> spp. Furthermore, human hookworm eggs may easily be confused with eggs of <i>Globocephalus</i> or <i>Oesophagostomum</i> spp. of pigs. Given the presence of many piggeries in the region I am not at all convinced that the authors really did find human hookworm eggs. Many <i>Ascaris</i> eggs might be <i>A. suum</i>, which is not infectious to man. In conclusion, it is very probable that most of the parasite eggs and cysts which were found originated from pigs and these are not infectious to man. Therefore, the conclusion that "These findings clearly show that most water sources in Nigerian rural communities constitute grave epidemiological threat to public health" is not justified.</p> <p>The authors did not answer my question whether or not the sampling was carried out randomly. This is important to know because the scientific value of the study depends on a correct sampling procedure.</p> <p>In the introduction the authors write "In nematodes species such as <i>Strongyloides stercoralis</i>, <i>Ascaris lumbricoides</i> and <i>Necator americanus</i>, the third stage larva is responsible for infection of new host." This is NOT correct because the infective stage of <i>A. lumbricoides</i> is the egg containing the L2 larva!</p>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Stanny Geerts
Department, University & Country	Animal Health Dept, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium (Retired)