

-----Original Message-----

From: XXX YYY<xxx@yyy.zzz>

Sent: Thu, Dec 19, 2013 at 9:13 PM

To: Managing Editor

Subject: RES: Request for final decision for manuscript number 2013_BMRJ_5635

I hadn't understood your request but I see you need the revised manuscript. I am sending the file attached. As previously explained I did not read the whole paper since there was already critical points preventing publication in the parts that I read.

Examples:

In rhizobia the two first genes analyzed were recA and atpD and they have been currently sequenced in many rhizobial species showing their usefulness in differentiation of species whose 16S rRNA genes are nearly identical. In the last years new schemes for identification and phylogenetic analysis of bacteria named MLSA (Multilocus sequence analysis) and MLST (Multilocus sequence typing) based in the analysis of several housekeeping genes have been applied in phylogenetic analyses of concrete groups of rhizobia [7]. Besides the housekeeping genes also named "core" genes, some "auxiliary" or "accessory" genes involved in the legume symbiosis are commonly included in species description of rhizobia and in some MLST analysis. The symbiotic genes from rhizobia are codified in plasmids in fast and some middle growing species and in symbiotic islands in the middle and slow growing ones. From these genes, the most studied in rhizobia are nodD, nodA, nodC and nifH. Nevertheless, the symbiotic genes are not useful in taxonomy because of their ability to be transferred in nature from plasmids to islands, from bacteria to plants and among bacteria. Therefore the analysis of symbiotic genes is overall useful to identify non-rhizobial species able to nodulate legumes and to carry out biogeography studies of legume endosymbionts [7]. These sentences in blue were COPIED from reference 7. The whole paragraph must be modified; otherwise the text will be considered plagiarism.

Sinorhizobium was proposed as the new genus of the fast-growing soybean rhizobia. This genus is separated from Rhizobium and Bradyrhizobium based on GC content, DNA-DNA hybridization data, numerical taxonomy, serological analysis data, composition of extracellular gum, bacteriophage typing data and soluble protein pattern (COPIED from a book: Phenotypic and Genotypic Diversity of Rhizobia) . Recently, the Judicial Commission of the International Committee on Systematics of Prokaryotes decided to transfer some species of the genus Sinorhizobium to the genus Ensifer [128]. (COPIED, can be found at: <http://benthamscience.com/ebooks/Sample/9781608054619-sample.pdf>)

I do not want to read the authors explanations on their plagiarism and I do not think the paper should be further considered for publication. There might be other parts copied and I don't think we should spend time on an article that has been identified as unethical. I suggest you reject the paper and tell the authors to resubmit a better version in the future.

Editor's Details:

Dr. Patricia Severino

Albert Einstein Research and Education Institute, Albert Einstein Hospital,
Sao Paulo, Brazil

Note: Modification was done in this document ONLY to hide the email id.