



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                               |
|--------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">British Microbiology Research Journal</a>                                                                                                         |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2015_BMRJ_16757                                                                                                                                               |
| Title of the Manuscript: | THE SERO-PREVALENCE OF HIV/AIDS AMONG PATIENTS SCREENED FROM 2008 - 2013 ATTENDING FEDERAL NEUROPSYCHIATRIC HOSPITAL BARNAWA KADUNA STATE NORTH WEST NIGERIA. |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                                                                     |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                            | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments | <p>1) Throughout the paper and in the abstract, the statistical data does not need to be presented in such detail. The authors could remove the second paragraph from the results section of the abstract and then remove lines 145-154 and 196-203. They present the highlights of these in the text and for this paper, there is no need to include these extra details.</p> <p>2) In the discussion section, the authors repeatedly note their results are "not in agreement" with other findings. I would urge them to reconsider this phrase and say things like "we found a higher prevalence." Some of the groups are not comparable in terms of absolute numbers (i.e. New York City has a much lower overall seroprevalence than Nigeria), but I think the results are consistent, in that rates of HIV in all populations were consistently higher than the general population rates. The authors may want to discuss why they think their rates were higher (i.e. this is a retrospective record review of all patients who underwent HIV testing, and since it was not routinely offered, providers may have done such testing only in persons with signs and symptoms of HIV). I think the discussion on the higher rates among women is a good one. I think the young age group merits discussing in this paper. I am not sure why the authors chose the age group they did (HIV is usually reported in breakdowns of 5-10 years (i.e.</p> | <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p>                                                                                                                                        |



SDI Review Form 1.6

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |    |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
|  | <p>under 5 years, 5-, 10-15, 15-24, 35-34, 35-44, etc.). Globally, rates are highest in the 25-44 age group, so I think it is significant that there is a younger age group here with the higher prevalence. Why do the authors think this happened?</p> <p>3) In terms of the conclusions, I think the authors are correct that HIV testing should be offered to all psychiatric patients as part of routine medical care. I would recommend avoiding the use of the word “compulsory” in the abstract and text as this word has a lot of negative connotations and goes back to a time when HIV was a highly stigmatized and deadly disease for which there were limited treatment options. We now live in a time where HIV is able to be effectively managed and people have access to ART. Therefore, in the same way we would offer patients access to testing of their glucose to look for Diabetes or creatinine to assess renal function, so to should they undergo HIV testing. But this argument gets obscured when words like “compulsory” are used. A better choice of words would allow readers to look at this important data with a more open frame of mind.</p> <p>4. The statement in line 81 about the 3 variables is confusing, as one of the variables is HIV status. Do the authors mean they collected data on the past HIV status? I understand the age and gender variables, but the HIV status needs to be better explained.</p> | Ok |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |    |
|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |    |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   | <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Line 78, remove the word “being”</li><li>2. Line 107 has a typo (“out” should be changed to “our”) and there seem to be some words missing from the rest of the sentence, as there is no age group information given.</li><li>3. One last review of the English should be done prior to acceptance to ensure the language is consistent with scholarly writing.</li></ol> | Ok |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. The authors might want to consider describing their study in the methodology section as “a retrospective record review of all patients who underwent HIV testing”</li></ol>                                                                                                                                                                                               |    |