



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                  |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Journal of Biochemistry Research &amp; Review</a>                                                      |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2013_IJBcRR_6262                                                                                                                 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Effects of Orlistat and herbal mixture extract on renal function and oxidative stress biomarkers in a rat model of high fat diet |
| Type of the Article      |                                                                                                                                  |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                        | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b><br>REVISION comments | <p>Although the manuscript provide some data with regards to the effect of the herbal mixture on obesity but is rejected (with repairable deficiencies and may be reconsidered).</p> <p>In this manuscript, the objective of the study is not clearly stated (both in the abstract as well in the introduction).</p> <p>In the introduction, the importance of using pumpkin oil with nutshell Extract in this study has not been explained.</p> <p>In the methodology, it has been mentioned as herbal mixture purchased from local market. It is not clearly stated whether the authors administered the extract individually or mix it and gave it as single administration and under what basis the dose selection done and when the period of drug/herbal mixture administration starts. In this study a group with administration of pumpkin oil and nutshell extract alone without HFD not been included which is important to understand the safety of the herbal mixture .</p> <p>In the methodology, it has been mentioned that perirenal, mesentric and epididymal adipose tissues were collected but the purpose of collection and data were not provided.</p> <p>In the result sections, the author has mentioned as high significant and the significant level whether it is <math>p &lt; 0.05, 0.01</math> or <math>0.001</math> not been mentioned. For example "The oral treatment of high fat diet with Orlistat exerted a <b>high significant</b> decrease in serum cholesterol and a <b>significant decrease</b> in serum triglyceride as compared to high fat diet rats."</p> |                                                                                                                                                                                      |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                            | <p>In the tables, the authors have used the symbol a,b,c,d whether the significant level is <math>p &lt; 0.05, 0.01</math> or <math>0.001</math> and from Table 1-4 what groups compared is not clear.</p> <p>In figure 1 also the significant level was not mentioned.</p> <p>Rephrasing of Table title is required. For example, Table 1 title "Effect of control and HFD on feed intake can be rephrased as "Means of food intake in control and HFD- induced rats.</p> <p>Overall english correction is required in the manuscript.<br/>Number of references can be reduced and to follow the journal format.</p> |  |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b><br>REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b><br>comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |

**Note: Anonymous Reviewer**