



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	2014_IJPSS_9021
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluation the Efficacy of Baker Yeast (<i>Saccaromyces cerevisiae</i>) and Chitosan to Controlling <i>Penicillium digitatum</i> Sacc. That Cause Green Mold Decay of Kumquat Fruits.
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>- Correct "<i>Penicillium digitatum</i>" throughout the text, including in the title;</p> <p>-Introduction, pg.2, lines 51-53 "The problem of stimulation ... (Fig.1.) [5]": The phrase is confusing;</p> <p>-Materials and Methods, pg.3, line 95: What is the origin of the fruits (city, country);</p> <p>-Pg.3, line 100: What is the collection of <i>P. digitatum</i> isolates? It is a Mycology collection ?;</p> <p>-Pg.3, lines 102-104: Delete "The pathogen was isolated ... on mango fruits"</p> <p>-Pg.3, line 104: How <i>P. digitatum</i> has been identified? Based on morphology? (Cite the Reference);</p> <p>-Pg.3, line 110: What is the origin of the baker yeast (commercial formulation);</p> <p>-Pg.3, line 125: What is the origin of the chitosan (commercial formulation);</p> <p>-Pg.3, line 129: Was used three replicate plates per treatment ?;</p> <p>-Pg.4, line 146: Was used three replicate plates per treatment ?;</p> <p>-Pg.4, line 155: Describe the position of the fruit where the wound was made and the size of the wound;</p> <p>-Pg.4, lines 160, 173 and 186: The fruits were stored at 20±2°C or 5°C?;</p>	All work was needed reforms



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p>-Pg.4, line 190: Describe the statistical design of experiments;</p> <p>-Results and Discussion, Pg.5, line 194: Replace “baker yeast” by “chitosan”;</p> <p>-Pg.5, Table .1.: Replace “19.5 f” by “19.5 e” ;</p> <p>-Pg.5-10, Delete Figures located below Tables 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5, because they are unnecessary;</p> <p>-Pg.6, line 215: Replace “chitosan” by “baker yeast”;</p> <p>-Pg.5-7, I suggest putting the linear regression equation and the value of significance (<i>p</i>) of the regression to the results obtained in vitro</p> <p>-Pg.7-9, Tables 3-5: Insert “Figures with the same letter are not significantly different (P=0.05).” below Tables 3-5;</p> <p>-Pg.8, lines265-273: Discuss the possible effect of induced resistance of chitosan;</p> <p>-Pg.8-10, Tables 4-6: Perform analysis of variance (Tukey test) for the data of % disease severity;</p> <p>-Pg.8-10: Try to discuss the results with other results involving the use of <i>Saccharomyces</i> and chitosan in control of green mold in Citrus spp. Some works follow below:</p> <p>PLATANIA C, RESTUCCIA C, MUCCILLI S, CIRVILLERI G. Efficacy of killer yeasts in the biological control of <i>Penicillium digitatum</i> on Tarocco orange fruits (<i>Citrus sinensis</i>). <i>Food Microbiol.</i> 2012; 30: 219-225.</p> <p>PIMENTA, RS. et al . Biological control of <i>Penicillium italicum</i>, <i>P. digitatum</i></p>	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p>and <i>P. expansum</i> by the predacious yeast <i>Saccharomycopsis schoenii</i> on oranges. Braz. j. microbiol;39(1):85-90, 2008.</p> <p>BENHAMOU N. Potential of the Mycoparasite, <i>Verticillium lecanii</i>, to Protect Citrus Fruit Against <i>Penicillium digitatum</i>, the Causal Agent of Green Mold: A Comparison with the Effect of Chitosan. Phytopathology. 2004; 94(7):693-705.</p> <p>WAHAB, W.M.A.; RASHID, I.A.S. Safe postharvest treatments for controlling <i>Penicillium</i> molds and its Impact maintaining navel Orange Fruits quality. American-Eurasian J. Agric. & Environ. Sci., 12 (7) 973-982, 2012.</p> <p>-Conclusion, Pg.11: The conclusion is not consistent with the observed results, as BY 2% alone had lower incidence compared associations with chitosan.</p>	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		