



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	2013_IJPSS_8827
Title of the Manuscript:	Seedling Emergence and Seed Germination of Shepherd's needle (<i>Scandix pecten-veneris</i>) as Affected by Seed Weight and Burial Depth
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>The references section should follow the authors guidelines eg</p> <p>2. Forcella F, Benech ARL, Sanchez R, Ghera CM. but not Forcella F., Benech A.R.L., Sanchez R., Ghera C.M.</p>	
Minor REVISION comments	<p>On bullet 12 and 13, keywords it is important to start with, seedling emergence; burial depth; seed weight; germination; and finally Scandix pecten-veneris;</p> <p>On bullet 44. It should read materials and methods</p> <p>On bullet 63 and 64 space between the number and mg i.e. 15 mg not 15mg and any other same occurrence after this</p> <p>On bullet 79 delete the word experiment between randomized and design. It is not important here. Also put space between 2 and mm, 2mm</p> <p>On bullet 88, push heading to next page not to hang</p> <p>On bullet 144 change 51,7% to 51.7%</p> <p>On bullet 194 delete (Fig. 1, 2).this need not be indicated in discussion. This is similarly to bullet 230, delete Fig. 3</p> <p>On bullet 234 to 236 "Suicide seed germination could be also another reason for low emergence at deep sowing depths but it is only a hypothesis since no retrieval of buried seeds was made in this study to check germination afterwards." Can also be reframed to read "Although no retrieval of buried seeds was made in this study to check germination afterwards suicide seed germination could probably also have been another</p>	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p>reason for low emergence at deep sowing depths " this removes the word hypothesis On bullet 245 can germinated-emerged be changed to germinated and emerged</p>	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	<p>Is it possible to have a conclusion and recommendation section. This can be from bullet 244 to 251</p> <p>Otherwise, this research contributes to science in weed control</p>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Geofrey K Gathungu
Department, University & Country	Plant Science Department, Chuka University, Kenya