



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</a>
Manuscript Number:	2014_IJPSS_12807
Title of the Manuscript:	<b><i>Puccinellia chinampoensis</i> Ohwi shows high selectivity of <math>K^+</math>, <math>Ca^{2+}</math> and <math>Mg^{2+}</math> over <math>Na^+</math> in the rhizosphere of sodic soil</b>
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments		
<b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments	<p>Puccinelliachinampoensis Ohwi, Generic name in italics and should be separated (genus and species). Title should not be conclusion of study if possible author should rephrase the title,</p> <p>Title shows ...space, sodic soil ...space</p> <p>Abstract .Sodic and alkaline soil...</p> <p>In the cultivation...delete it. Directly start sentence in artificial soil...</p> <p>Which other plants were used in study????? whole abstract should be rechecked for space between words. L19-25 should be checked for space between words. L25 Raised to 10.</p> <p>L35 has been facing</p> <p>L42 high palatability ...space</p> <p>L49 recovering of vegetation</p> <p>L53,55 characteristics L55 A complete study about characteristics of.....L57 so the focus of this study was to understand the uptake of....</p> <p>L64. without sodification. As for we know ...delete it. L66 nutrient uptake ...L55.56 and 67,68,, repetition of same claim.</p> <p>L76 the site from where soil was collected...</p> <p>L122...Into two parts and each part was 9....Square measures. L140</p> <p>In growth chamber under control conditions?????</p> <p>Temperature, humidity, atmospheric pressure, light intervals????? L142 Table 1.....In this experiment. delete full sentence L155. showed L167 showed</p> <p>Table 1, Chemical properties of the sodic and artificial soil. L167-170</p> <p>IF POSSIBLE PLS Add how much highest and how much lowest value from control.</p>	



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

	<p>L198.The chemical properties of experimental soil has been presented in table 2.L205 fertile soil...</p> <p>L207.The shoot dry weight of L. chinensis was significantly 208 higher than that of P. chinampoensis( Fig 4).L262 good germination ability.L264 to its survival.Further investigation could help to reach the conclusion..L279.Add recent reference to support the claim.L305 add reference to support the results. L333,it is shown ???Table or Fig?????L372 Data indicated</p> <p>L338 Na tolerant....</p>	
<b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments	<p>The paper presents good and informative study about macro nutrient uptake of forage plants in sodic and alkaline soils. English grammar mistakes and space between words should be carefully rechecked by the authors throughout the paper. Some sentences are very long and difficult to understand, should be replaced by short sentences. In the discussion section the data should be analyzed according to previous studies ,may be on different plants in support of presented results. Addition of latest and recent citation from the years 2013/2014 will be advantageous to increase the credibility of paper.</p>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Munazza Gull</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Biochemistry dept,King Abdulaziz University,Saudi Arabia</b>