



SDI Review Form 1.6

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name: | International Journal of Plant & Soil Science |
| Manuscript Number: | 2014_IJPSS_12807 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <i>Puccinellia chinampoensis</i> Ohwi shows high selectivity of K^+ , Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+} over Na^+ in the rhizosphere of sodic soil |
| Type of the Article | Original Research Article |

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|-------------------------------------|--|---|
| Compulsory REVISION comments | | |
| Minor REVISION comments | <p>Please, separate the words properly all along the manuscript, i.e: Title: "<i>Puccinelliachinampoensis</i> Ohwishowshighselectivityof...[...]", should be: <i>Puccinellia chinampoensis</i> Ohwi shows high selectivity of...[...]" Abstract: - Please define CEC and EC, as ESP is defined. - "<i>Leimuschinensis</i>" should be "<i>Leymus chinensis</i> (Trin.) Tzvelev" Introduction: -Line 35, "[...] sodic soils has been serious problem[...]" should be "[...] sodic soils has been a serious problem[...]" -Line 41 "<i>Leimuschinensis</i>" should be "<i>Leymus chinensis</i>" -Line 46: "<i>P.chinampoensis</i>" instead of "<i>Pucciniella chinampoensis</i>". The whole name is not necessary any more along the manuscript. -Line 49: "There is a few study" should be "There are a few studies" -Line 53, 55: "characteristics" instead of "chalacteristics" -Line 60: "<i>P.chinampoensis</i>" instead of "<i>Pucciniella chinampoensis</i> Ohwi" -Line 63: "<i>P.chinampoensis</i> in related with [...]" should be "<i>P.chinampoensis</i> related to [...]" Material and methods: -Line 75-76: "This area is suffered from [...]" should be "This area suffers from [...]" -Line 77: "<i>P.chinampoensis</i>" instead of "<i>Pucciniella chinampoensis</i> Ohwi" -Lines 79-80: first time EC, CEC and ESP are named in this section they should be written both, specifically and with acronym, i.e. "exchangeable cations (EC)", "cation exchangeable capacity (CEC)", "exchangeable sodium percentage (ESP)" -Line 88: "[...] under a sunlight [...]" should be "[...] under sunlight [...]" -Line 93: "<i>P.chinampoensis</i>" instead of "<i>Pucciniella chinampoensis</i> Ohwi" -Line 96: "After the two months growth [...]" should be "After two months of growth [...]" -Line 105: "Jilin agricultural university" should be "Jilin Agricultural University" -Lines 112-115: Homogenise names, or CEC, CE, ESP, or cation exchangeable capacity, etc.</p> | |



SDI Review Form 1.6

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| | <p>-Line 123: "<i>Leimus chinensis</i>" should be "<i>Leymus chinensis</i>", but instead, best "<i>L.chinensis</i>"; same for "<i>Pucciniella chinampoensis</i> Ohwi", delete and leave "<i>P.chinampoensis</i>".</p> <p>RESULTS:</p> <p>-Table 1 and Table 2: Add legend for EC, CEC and ESP (specify acronyms)</p> <p>DISCUSSION:</p> <p>-Line 274: "[...] sodic soils were suffered [...]" should be "[...] sodic soils surrefred [...]"</p> <p>-Line 277: "[...] would be essential [...]" should be "[...] would be an essential [...]"</p> <p>-Line 287: "[...] as compared with[...]" should be "[...] as compared to [...]"</p> <p>-Line 292: "Rocky Mountains" instead of "Rocking mountains" and "North America" instead of "north America"</p> <p>- Line 295: "[...]plant have high tolerance for many environmental harm[...]" should be "[...] plant has high tolerance for many environmental harms [...]"</p> <p>-Line 296: "[...] over Na⁺ to [...]" should be "[...] over Na⁺ than [...]"</p> <p>-Line 300: "[...] it had the low [...]" should be "[...] it had the lowest [...]"</p> <p>-Line 324: "This may be the reason that [...]" should be "This may be the reason why [...]"</p> <p>-Line 339: "[...] (in <i>Pucciniellia</i> genus) [...]" is not necessary, it is obvious, so delete it.</p> <p>CONCLUSIONS:</p> <p>-Line 368-369: In this case, as this is the conclusions section, leave "<i>Pucciniella chinampoensis</i> Ohwi" and delete "<i>P.chinampoensis</i>".</p> <p>-Line 375: "<i>Leimus chinensis</i>" should be "<i>Leymus chinensis</i>"</p> <p>REFERENCES:</p> <p>-As well, as in the rest of the manuscript, review the proper separation of words.</p> <p>-Reference 28, line 453: "Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations" instead of "Food and agriculture organization of the united nations"</p> <p>-Reference 38, line 477: The proper writing of these authors' names is: "Abadía J, Vázquez S, Rellán-Álvarez R, El-Jendoubi H, Abadía A, Álvarez-Fernández A, López-Millán AF."</p> | |
| <p>Optional/General comments</p> | | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Name: | Daniel de la Torre Llorente |
| Department, University & Country | Plant Biology Department, ETSI, Agricultural, Technical University of Madrid, Spain |