



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	2014_IJPSS_9021
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluation the Efficacy of Baker Yeast (<i>Saccaromyces cerevisiae</i>) and Chitosan to Controlling <i>Penicillium digitatum</i> Sacc. That Cause Green Mold Decay of Kumquat Fruits.
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>Title: Remove the uppercase letter of the word "That". Then you should write the name of the person author who described <i>Saccaromyces cerevisiae</i>. You should write <i>Saccaromyces cerevisiae</i> Meyen ex E.C.Hansen.</p> <p>The Abstract is incomplete and you should write it according to the standards of the journal (items: aims, study design, place and duration of the study, the methodology, results and conclusion). It does not indicate place and duration of the experiment and you should clarify the used methodology (data that are present in Materials and Methods).</p> <p>Keywords are the same as written in the title, so I suggest to replace them with other words.</p> <p>The title says "... <i>Penecillium digitatium</i> Sacc. That Cause Green Mold Decay of Kumquat Fruits ", however, in the keyword and Introduction you name it "Green mold disease". I suggest to edit the title and use the latter term.</p> <p>Line 54: the phrase says, "... as proposed by Hall." You do not indicate the reference year to check what was proposed by this author.</p> <p>Line 87 is quoted "<i>S. serevisiae</i>" but you have never written the genus before, so you must write. <i>Saccharomyces cerevisiae</i> (Besides, <i>cerevisiae</i> sometimes</p>	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p>appears with "c" and others with "s").</p> <p>In the line 95 of Materials and Methods, says “kumquat fruits were collected in orchards or packers”. Details about the place or city where there were collected are missing.</p> <p>The first title of Results and discussion is misspelled. It should say "Effect of different concentrations of chitosan" you should not say Baker yeast.</p> <p>Line 208 is quoted “<i>R. stolonifer</i>” and you have never mentioned the genus before. <i>Rhizopus stolonifer</i> (Ehrenb.) Vuill.</p> <p>Lines 212 and 239: The phrase should say Treatment instead of Figures.</p> <p>Line 213: The title of Figure 2 is missing. → Figure 2. <i>Effect of</i></p> <p>In Figures 2 and 3, you must remove the title of the vertical axis of the graph (linear growth mm), as this axis has two variables that are represented by the color bars. The same is observed in Figures 5 and 6, where the title must be removed from the vertical axis (% incidence of green mold). You should indicate in the figure references what represent the color bars or put two vertical axis indicating the variables represented by the different colors and the units of each variable.</p> <p>The second title of Results and Discussion is misspelled. It should say "<i>Effect of different concentrations of baker yeast</i>" you should not say chitosan.</p> <p>Line 218: Add: Results are presented in Table 2 and Figure 3</p> <p>Line 240: The title of Figure 3 should be written → <i>Fig.3. Effect of</i></p>	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p>Line 218: Add: Results are presented in Table 2 and Figure 3 (Repite)</p> <p>Line 244: Add: Results are presented in Table 3 and Figure 4</p> <p>After the Table 3 the title Fig.4 should be written (<i>Effect of different ...</i>)</p> <p>In the Figure 4 you should correct the name of the treatments, that are incomplete (eg: Chitosan ¼ % + BY 2).</p> <p>Line 260: Add: Results are presented in Table 4 and Figure 5.</p> <p>After the Table 4 (line 278) should be written the title of Fig.5: Effect of fruits coating ... Also you should improve the structure of the orange bars (especially treatments Chitosan ½ % and Chitosan 1 %).</p> <p>Line 282: Add: Results are presented in Table 5 and Figure 6</p> <p>After the Table 5 the title of Fig.6 should be written (<i>Effect of coating fruits ...</i>)</p> <p>In the Bibliography you must cite according to the "Rules of Writing Magazine." For example: There should not be a point between the abbreviations of the author names. Between the surname and initial of the author, you should not put a comma (eg cited 1).</p> <p>You should unify the criteria used to name the journals. Abbreviations are used in some references, but no in all them (eg compare reference 26 and 34). Besides, sometimes you use italics, you should eliminate italics in the cite 36.</p> <p>I suggest that the methodology presented to evaluate the effects of different concentrations of the backer yeast, chitosan and a mixture of both in the green mold incidence and severity of disease caused by <i>Penecillium digitatium</i> in the kumquat fruits (page 4), should be written in one paragraph. I suggest to avoid</p>	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	the repetition of the methodology.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	<p>Line 53: Give a space between <i>Penicillium digitatum</i>Sacc.</p> <p>Line 57: in the title of the figure 1 you should write the name of the person author who described <i>Penicillium digitatum</i> Sacc.</p> <p>You should correct many typing errors in lines: Line 102 (4°C). Line 156 (23-25°C). Line160 (2°C). Lines 152, 164, 176, 281, 295, 317 (5°C). Leave a line between line 174 and 175. Line 207 (ml⁻¹).</p> <p>Line 198: Add the text: <i>Results are presented in Table 1 and Figure 2</i></p> <p>Line 249: Add "and" between <i>Candida satoianaor</i> and <i>Cryptococcus laurentii</i>.</p> <p>Line 286: Add point <i>et al</i>.</p> <p>Line 306: You must add a space after <i>et al</i>.2007.</p>	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	<p>This paper reports many interesting observations about the use of Baker yeast (<i>Saccaromyces cerevisiae</i>) and Chitosan to controlling <i>Penecilium digitatum</i> Sacc. The results obtained in this study allow the authors conclude that the combined use of Baker yeast and chitosan as a new high-efficiency alternative to control postharvest diseases of fruits. I suggest future research including the use of biological control and to try other types of fruit and vegetables. Some corrections should be done on the content and form before its publication.</p>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Petigrosso, Lucas Ricardo
Department, University & Country	Agricultural Engineer , National University of Mar del Plata, Argentina