



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</a>
Manuscript Number:	2014_IJPSS_13371
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Agronomic Performance of Local and High Yielding Varieties of Boro Rice Under Different Age of Seedlings</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p><b>Add justification how and why seedling age 25days is the best? The authors claim lacks experimental evidence as their study did not include period beyond 25 days.</b></p> <p><b>Add research need to have interaction of age vs no of seedlings planting/hill</b></p> <p><b>Method of creating seedlings sown on different days vs seedling raised on one day and planted on different days. This fact depicts the real practice of rice cultivation and takes account of variations in the optimum date of sowing.</b></p> <p><b>The SRI is claimed as innovation on plant physiology which finds low consideration in the research of authors in their article.</b></p> <p><b>How is world's feeling and acceptance of Boro rice which is blamed to emit methane and nitrous oxide throughout the period, ie by aman and boro rice cultivation in Bangladesh and many other countries.</b></p> <p><b>Why rice growing countries do not think of crop diversification for reducing water consumption,</b></p>	<p>Justification was made in the text in Results and Discussion chapter based on the findings regarding number of grain, 1000 grain weight, number of effective tiller, number of filled spikelet etc. Inclusion of more seedling age could require more resource, which was not available.</p> <p>Yes, this may be frontier researches with local and high yielding varieties.</p> <p>Seeds were sown in nursery beds at different dates to attain 15, 20 and 25 day-old seedlings at the same date on which seedlings were transplanted in the field.</p> <p>Actually this research work was conducted to see the effect of seedling age on different varieties considering the square planting method and use of single seedling/hill of SRI. Some management practices could be followed to reduce emission of methane and nitrous oxide gases. In Bangladesh, the scientists are conducting some experiments on conservation tillage, deep placement of Nitrogenous fertilizer and some other management practices for reducing GHG emission. We know rice is a staple food for south- asian people. So it will not be easy to meet up food</p>



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

	<b>improving food quality and reducing intake of As in the food chain?</b>	demand excluding rice of this vast population. Including Crop Diversification scientists are working for developing technologies like AWD method, aerobic technique etc. Cereals, pulses, vegetable etc. grown in the north, western parts where As is considered a problem are supplied to other parts of Bangladesh. But the people of other parts are not so affected like north-western. So, As is still a researchable area to Doctors and Agriculturists.
<b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments	Some part of English in the text where they claim their best result of 25 days of seedling age.	Made
<b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments	<p>The article is traditional agronomical experiment, based on traditional knowledge of agronomy in Bangladesh.</p> <p>It is valuable for Bangladesh, but for international readership it has low value on the universal application of the resulting science.</p> <p>IF it is for Bangladesh journal, it is o.k., but for international readability and use ability it gets low merit.</p>	<p>The local varieties were not included earlier in any other experiments. Some results sometimes may become important for the world community. Lately we know about the international importance of 'Khasalot' a native rice variety of Bangladesh.</p> <p>The findings of this experiment may be a good source for the plant breeders and plant physiologists of other corners of the world.</p>