



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	2014_IJPSS_13371
Title of the Manuscript:	Agronomic Performance of Local and High Yielding Varieties of Boro Rice Under Different Age of Seedlings

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p>The author's comments were seen. Inclusion of another age planting beyond 25 say 30 days would not cost resources that cannot be managed. Research method should have been devised to include 15, 22 and 29 days seedlings that should have enabled interpolation of the maximum yield giving age of seedling. Authors failed to do this in their study.</p> <p>Further, this study is for one season and being elaborated too much. It would be unfair to make recommendation on the basis of one season results in agronomy. It seems that research was from M.Sc thesis student project. It warranted at least two years data for confirmatory results. Authors claim on plant characters viz tillers, panicles and 1000 grain weight have no significance in the study, as fine grain rice is to have low 1000 grain weight for its acceptable quality. The process involved in rice cultivation that nursery raised once and planting done on different days would bring clear cut result on age of planting and duration of crop. Of course there may be optimum time for raising nursery for Boro rice in Bangladesh. Authors' claim of 25 days old seedling planting should be limited to coarse grain variety. For all varieties the study displays that it is not advisable to produce aromatic variety in Bangladesh on economic consideration. The cost of cultivation of rice in Bangladesh is very high.</p> <p>For unconfirmed results recommendation would misguide farmers in Bangladesh in particular and other countries in general. One year data may inspire agronomists to carry out research and reach to the confirmatory results. In this situation, the article justify to be published as a research note and not as full research article.</p> <p>Publish as research note (short article), but not as full-fledged research article. Fig does not add clear cut information; coaxial graph on fixed scale for the four varieties will display results that which variety should be planted with 25 days old seedling.</p>	<p>The experiment may be conducted including 30, 35, 40, 45 ---60 days old seedlings. But in this experiment 15, 20 and 25 days old seedlings were included. So, there is no opportunity to include any other treatments at this stage. Hence, the results need to be evaluated with this perspective.</p> <p>Two year results are better to make any recommendation. But sincere and cautious studies are also important and helpful for making conclusion from one year results. Conclusion has been made in this way.</p> <p>There is no scope of repeating the experiment in our system. It is a continuous process and including more treatments several experiments may be conducted by the interested researchers from any corner of the world.</p> <p>With the above mentioned justification, I think the manuscript may be considered to be published as full-length article.</p> <p>Spelling BRRI dhan29 and BRRI dhan28 is recommended by the BRRI, the institute has developed these varieties.</p>