



**SDI Review Form 1.5**

**PART A:**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE &amp; Health</a>                                                                                                                                |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>MS: 2012/IJTDH/1762</b>                                                                                                                                                                            |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Association Between Sickle Cell Trait and Low Density Parasitaemia Among Asymptomatic and Parasitaemic individuals Living in <i>P. falciparum</i> Malaria Holoendemic Region of Western Kenya.</b> |

*(Note: Title of different sections as proposed below may differ in case of review paper)*



## SDI Review Form 1.5

### **PART B: Review Comments**

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part and write here 'Corrected'/ if not agreed, give suitable justifications) |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>General comment:</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | <b>Well written paper and easy to read and follow. The paper needs to follow the instructions to authors.</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                           |
| <b>Specific comments:</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Should be published after minor correction. I would like to see a comment on the ethnic composition since ethnicity is a surrogate marker of genetic background and the main confounding factor in genetic association studies.                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                           |
| <b>Title and abstract</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | The title should clearly states if the work in on severe malaria or severe malarial anaemia. The key words should below the abstract text.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                           |
| <b>Introduction</b> (Is the problem/objective of this study original, important and well defined?)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | The research question is well introduced. I will suggest two papers to the authors. The first is a more recent paper (2008) compared to the one cited in the paper (2005) by Mibei et al. 2008 which is directly related to SMA. The second is a paper by Thomas, BN et al. (Biomarker Insights, 2012;7:81-86 on the association between CIC and severe malaria in Mali.                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Are all the references cited relevant, adequate? Are there any other suitable current references authors need to cite?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | The references are relevant to the work. I will suggest including the two references above.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                           |
| <b>Materials &amp; methods</b> (Kindly comment on the suitability of the methods. Sufficient details of the methods should be provided to allow peers to evaluate and/or replicate the work)                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | The Materials and methods section is well written. However, the inclusion criteria were not clear to me.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                           |
| <b>Results &amp; discussion</b> (Kindly comment on: 1. Are the data well controlled and robust? 2. Authors should provide relevant references during discussion. 3. Discussion and conclusions should be based on actual facts and figures. Biased claims should be pointed out. 4. Are statistical analyses must for this paper? If yes, have sufficient and appropriate statistical analyses been carried out?) | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The data are well presented with relevant statistic tests.</li> <li>2. Good references in the discussion</li> <li>3. Discussion and conclusion are good</li> <li>4. The statistic tests used are convenient to the results. The authors need to provide the p-value with two digits according the Journal instructions.</li> </ol> <p>The authors need to provide the legend for figure 2 and 3.</p> |                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Are there any ethical or competing interest issues?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | There are no ethical or competing issues.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                           |
| <b>Conclusion</b> (Is the conclusion supported by the data, discussed inside the manuscript? Conclusions should not be biased and should be based on the data, presented inside the manuscript only)                                                                                                                                                                                                              | The conclusion is in relation with the data.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                           |
| References                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | The references should be listed alphabetically not in alpha-numerical order. The authors' names need to be followed                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                           |



**SDI Review Form 1.5**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |
|--|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|  | by the year of publication. For all the reference cited in the text (introduction, discussion), the authors need to remove the initial. E.g. Mibei et al. 2008 instead of Mibei <b>EK</b> et al. 2008. |  |
|--|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |                                                                            |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Name:                            | <b>Mahamadou Diakite, PharmD, DPhil</b>                                    |
| Department, University & Country | <b>Faculty of Medicine and Pharmacy, university of Bamako, West Africa</b> |