



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	2013_IJTDH_5966
Title of the Manuscript:	VALIDITY OF ACID-FAST SMEAR OF GASTRIC ASPIRATES FOR THE DIAGNOSIS OF CHILDHOOD PULMONARY TUBERCULOSIS AMONG HUMAN IMMUNODEFICIENCY VIRUS-INFECTED CHILDREN

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Thank you for the opportunity to review this revision. The authors did a good job of responding to the initial comments. A few additional comments: The discussion should state more strongly that a limitation of the study is the lack of quantitatively controlling for severity of disease. The revised manuscript does discuss this to some degree in lines 221-226, but it should more strongly state that the severity of disease, especially cavitation, expansile pneumonia, or other disease presentations which would increase the expected yield of gastric aspirates, was not quantified in this study and is a limitation. Please remove line 226-228 – As this was a non-randomised observational study, there is no reason to believe these confounders were randomly distributed between the two groups. This sentence should be removed.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Anthony J. Garcia-Prats
Department, University & Country	Desmond Tutu TB Centre, Department of Paediatrics and Child Health, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, Stellenbosch University, South Africa