



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART A:

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012/IJTDH/1693
Title of the Manuscript:	Anti-diabetic activity of aqueous extracts of <i>Vitexdoniana</i> leaves and <i>Cinchona calisaya</i> bark in alloxan – induced diabetic rats.

PART B:

	FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
For comments of JM and author's feed back	Most of the concerns and questions have been addressed/clarified/corrected. However, the following problems still exist in the revised manuscript: 1) The phytochemical analysis done in this paper does not give precise information about quantities of the secondary metabolites. There is no specification where the cut off value for "trace amounts" are and what falls under "intensely present". The results appear to be very subjective and therefore unscientific. 2) All figures still lack any indications of significant differences. The p values are discussed in the results section but not added to the figures. 3) For future experiments the experimental setup should be considered more carefully. It would be advisable to get rats of same age and weight (100g-175g is giving a huge variation in weight). The water after the extraction procedure should be removed via freeze drying process to ensure the quality of the extract is not affected.	
For comments of GD and author's feed back		
For comments of AG and author's feed back		
For comments of Reviewer 4 and author's feed back		
For comments of Reviewer 5 and author's feed back		
For comments of Reviewer 6 and author's feed back		

PART C: Recommendation: Point 1) and 2) (see above) should still be addressed by the authors. Figures should always be self-explanatory and therefore need to have all the statistical data included. I leave it up to the journal editor to decide if the Phytochemical results add any value to this paper.

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Dr Janine MacKenzie
Department, University & Country	Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University, South Africa