



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	2014_IJTDH_13800
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluation of Janani Suraksha Yojana (JSY) in Maharashtra, India: Important lessons for implementation
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	1. Abstract must reflect the fact that 23% women were not sure about whether they received the JSY benefits to give the reader an unbiased understanding of the results. 2. One of the objectives of the study is to study the factors affecting the implementation of the scheme. In this context, it would be beneficial to analyze whether 'Awareness of the scheme was affected by area of residence'. This could help implementers design targeted awareness generation campaigns. 3. Considering that introduction of ASHAs is a salient feature of the National Health Mission and that a key component of the JSY scheme is the incentive provided to ASHAs for institutional deliveries, it is crucial to understand the role of ASHAs in promotion of JSY. In this context: a. In the discussion section (line 269), it is stated that 'Commonest source of information was ANM and ASHA in our study but contrarily information was received from relatives and friends more frequently than ASHA and ANM'. This sentence is unclear needs further clarification. b. It is also stated that 'In Maharashtra infrastructure is well developed and ANMs	1. Now included in the abstract. 2. Now included. 3. Role of ASHA is certainly important. The study did not intend to measure their role. There are many studies carried out regarding role of AHSAS in JSY through UNFPA and UNICEF funding. They have been referred. a. The finding was from different study. It is made clear now.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	function reasonably and therefore they surpass ASHA’. Both statements point towards minimal role of ASHAs in promotion of JSY. However, one must answer the following questions before making the above statements: 1. The current study population consisted of women delivered in the year 2008-2009. Were ASHAs introduced in both tribal & non tribal areas of Maharashtra during this period? 2. If not, has the source of information in tribal and non-tribal areas been analysed separately? 3. Is there a significant difference between source of information in tribal & non tribal areas? 4. Had ASHAs completed introductory/ Module I training during the reference period? It may be incorrect to make the above statements about the role of ASHAs without appraising the reader about the above facts.	b. Explained below; 1. ASHA scheme was introduced in tribal areas first (July 2007) and then in non-tribal areas (November 2008) and functioning. The comment is added now. 2. A line about separate analysis is included. 3. Not ASHAs from tribal area had been trained and training of ASHAs from non-tribal areas was partly completed.
--	--	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Minor grammatical error at line number 97 Table 2 , word category area, it appears that the word 'tribal' is missing next to the word 'Non' in the bracket against rural	Corrected. Corrected.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	The study, though dated, provides good insights into the factors affecting uptake of JSY in Maharashtra and can help implementing authorities to undertake targeted interventions. It should thus be taken up for publication with minor modifications.	