



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                            |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE &amp; Health</a>                     |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_IJTDH_14340                                                                           |
| Title of the Manuscript: | The Japanese decline in secondary sex ratio correlates with percentage change in GDP/annum |
| Type of the Article      |                                                                                            |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments      | <p>The topic of birth sex is very interesting and deserved to publish in a prestigious journal. Hence, it has potential for publication according to the following suggestions.</p> <p>1 The authors observed a profound society phenomenon. It could be a great finding. However, the authors should provide the potential explanations careful. Otherwise it was more likely to be pseudo-science or "fishing game" in statistic.</p> <p>2 The potential explanation behind economic development and birth sex could be due environment change including the economic factors. Previous study already pointed out social economic could affect the birth sex. The girl was more likely to be survival in the bad situation. Of noted, the authors used the living people birth-sex ratio. That could be the results after "natural selection". The boy could have high death rate during the delivery in the bad GDP time.</p> <p>3 There were many other risk factors could affect the birth sex, e.g. season effect. Climatic change. The author should address them in the limitation if the authors cannot deeply discuss in the discussion.</p> <p>4 Update and add the following references.</p> <p>1. The association between season of pregnancy and birth-sex among Chinese. Xu T, Lin D, Liang H, Chen M, Tong W, Mu Y, Feng CX, Gao Y, Zheng Y, Sun W. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2014 Aug 11;11(8):8166-74.</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The possibility of confounding factors is mentioned and a specific paper (Fukuda 2014) is now cited in this regard as a possible confounder.</li> <li>2. The reviewer is quite correct. The discussion now alludes to the Trivers-Willard hypothesis and to Myers and Williams and Gloster and others.</li> <li>3. The effect of climate change is mentioned as per point 1. above. Other limitations mentioned include seasonality as requested.</li> <li>4. These references are now included in the discussion as suggested by the reviewer:</li> </ol> <p>Xu T, Lin D, Liang H, Chen M, Tong W, Mu Y, Feng CX, Gao Y, Zheng Y, Sun W. The association between season of pregnancy and birth-sex among Chinese. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2014;11:8166-74.</p> <p>Xu T, Lin D, Liang H, Chen M, Tong W, Mu Y, Feng CX, Gao Y, Zheng Y, Sun W. The association between season of pregnancy and birth-sex among Chinese. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2014;11:8166-74.</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|-----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                         | <b>doi: 10.3390/ijerph110808166.</b><br><b>2. Jongbloet, P.H. Siberian live birth sex ratios and the SPrOO hypothesis. J. Epidemiol. Community Health 2004, 58, 528. Available online: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1732792/pdf/v058p00528.pdf">www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1732792/pdf/v058p00528.pdf</a></b> |  |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |