



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	2013_IJTDH_6387
Title of the Manuscript:	NUTRITIONAL STATUS OF TUBERCULOSIS CASES BY HIV STATUS AND OTHER FACTORS ASSOCIATED WITH MALNUTRITION IN THREE HIGH TB/HIV BURDEN PROVINCES, KENYA
Type of the Article	Original Research

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	a)The article discusses the association between Nutritional statuses of Tuberculosis Cases by HIV Status. Although it is a good study I have some concerns about the nutritional status of the healthy controls in those provinces. b)Hope the standards set by WHO can be taken into consideration and analyze accordingly.	a)This study has utilized a cross-sectional design, hence we don't have cases and controls like in case control studies. Cases as referred to in this study are smear positive TB cases. This has now been made clear in the study population: page 4- Study population: The study participants were notified smear positive TB cases on anti-TB treatment that were above 18 years of age and gave informed consent. Patients who had completed TB treatment were not enrolled to the study. At analysis level, those who had a high BMI (> 25) were excluded from the analysis. Based on other reviewers comments our outcome of measure is now low BMI and the title of the study has been revised to: (Page 1-) <i>Predictors of low Body mass index among patients with smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis in Kenya</i> b) The universally accepted WHO 2013,BMI standards have been used (reference 4). Page 3 'Malnutrition indicators are assessed using body mass index (BMI). BMI is classified as normal if it lies between 18.5 - 25.0, low if ≤ 18.0 and high if ≥ 25.0.' Based on comments from another review we have low BMI as our outcome measure: Page4- A variable for the outcome of interest BMI was generated from weight and height. Persons with a BMI of <18.0 were classified as low BMI, 18.5 – 25.0 as normal BMI, while those with a BMI of >25 were classified as



SDI Review Form 1.6

	c) Conclusion should be little elaborative with present policies of the Nutrition which can improve the impact.	high BMI. Low BMI is the outcome of measure in this study. c) Conclusion has been revised to “Lack of employment is a predictor of low BMI in TB cases. Nutritional status does not differ by HIV status. TB programs should consider developing guidelines to identify high risk TB cases for ‘nutrition support as an integral adjuvant therapy.”
--	--	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	d) Results can be presented Para wise for every aspect to improve readers understanding. e)More reference can be added about the nutritional status in those provinces or if this is the first study please mention in the article that this is first study.	d) Results section is now clearer because we have excluded high BMI based on comments from other reviewers. We now have only four tables Table 1: Table 1: Social, demographic, economic and clinical characteristics by HIV status of TB cases who underwent nutrition assessment in three high TB/HIV burden provinces, July 2010 to May 2011, Kenya Table 2: Table 2: Association between social, demographic, economic and clinical characteristics with low Body Mass Index (BMI) in smear positive pulmonary TB cases who underwent nutrition assessment in three high TB/HIV burden provinces, July 2010 to May 2011, Kenya Table 3: Table 3: Risk factors associated low Body Mass Index (BMI) in smear positive pulmonary TB cases who underwent nutrition assessment in three high TB/HIV burden provinces, July 2010 to May 2011, Kenya Table 4: Table 4: Predictors of low Body Mass Index (BMI) in smear positive pulmonary TB cases who underwent nutrition assessment in three high TB/HIV burden provinces, July 2010 to May 2011, Kenya e) This is the first study to look at the nutritional status of TB patients in Kenya.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		