



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	2013I_IJTDH_6118
Title of the Manuscript:	THE INCIDENCE AND INVESTIGATION ON TEN FLOCKS INFECTED WITH GUMBORO DISEASE VIRUS (IBDV) IN ZARIA

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
1. BBR, SBR and TBR data are really confusable. Can you explain how you did the analysis? For example BBR (figure 3), if you analysed the data according each flock, at lease F8, F3, F1 and F10 don't 'reach the peak' as you discussed in line 130-131. As well as the SBR and TBR data in figure 4 and 5. Or if you combined the data from all flocks together, can you just list one line? 2. Line 152 you said the one vaccination even more likely to have IBD than none vaccination ones. Can you explain how could that happened? 3. Line 138. Your data only support a discussion that a poultry disease occurred in June is more probably an IBD, but not IBD are 'more likely occurred in June'. I am confused why you stand analyse you data based on the disease case number but not the total flocks number (diseased and no diseased) in that area.	1. BBR, SBR and TBR of each flock were calculated. [Line 130-131] In BBR, for F8, the peak was at day 1; for F3 the BBR data was only being able to calculated on for a day ie day 2; for F1, it peak on day 4 and the BBR data was not also being able to be calculated for the rest of the days and for F10, it peak on day 5. The BBR data were not calculated on some days as seen in the figure because on reaching to those farms the farmer has disposed the dead birds. Correction is noted for flock 8 and 3 in line 131 1nd 132. The same thing is applicable to SBR and TBR data in figure 4 and 5. 2. According to Muller et al. {2003} vaccinating birds early in life when the Maternal Derived antibodies titre is high will result in the neutralizing of the vaccine strain in the body system of the chicks thereby reducing the titre of the antibodies induced by the vaccine and revaccination is necessary to avoid the chicks coming down with disease. 3. sir, it is not a control study but the data were obtained from field cases and during the period of study March to July 2009, 10 flocks that came down with the disease were visited; during which we collected specimens and daily information from the flocks while the 23 flocks we were not able to visit, we obtained information concerning them as recorded in the clinical record of the Ahmadu Bello Teaching Hospital Zaria Nigeria