



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	2014_IJTDH_9362
Title of the Manuscript:	The study of social profile and some health problems associated with body weight disorders in upper Egypt male youth

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The authors have substantially improved their manuscript and most of the issues have been clarified. Thank you for this effort. I still find the justification of the sample size calculation rather weak. A clear sign of problems with sample size design are the extremely few cases of reported DM and hypertension. Essentially this is due to the much lower prevalence of DM/hypertension in the target age group as compared to obesity/overweight which the authors used to calculate their sample size. In consequence, the small sample size lowers the “value” of Table 2 substantially. Hence, the authors may want to consider to drop DM/hypertension entirely and concentrate on the “social factors” of obesity/overweight. Technically, the issues with Table 1 have been explained. However, the purpose and rationale for presenting Table 1 in this way are, in my opinion, quite unusual. To document the contribution of individual states to overall prevalence of obesity/overweight is one thing. Unfortunately, this approach does not help to understand why within states prevalence (in the sample) are substantially different and hence contribute to overall prevalence with weights which are in some cases substantially different from what can be expected from their respective shares of the total sample. In my opinion, the paper could further be improved by addressing the two issues mentioned above. However, these are minor issues and I leave it to editor and/or authors to decide on this matter.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Thomas Volken
Department, University & Country	School of Health Profession, Zurich University of Applied Sciences, Switherland