



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	2014_IJTDH_12611
Title of the Manuscript:	USEFULNESS OF ASCITIC FLUID CHOLESTEROL AND PROTEIN IN THE DIFFERENTIAL DIAGNOSIS OF ASCITES IN NIGERIA: COMPARISM WITH CONVENTIONAL CYTOLOGY.



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments									
Paper font size: The manuscript should be written in 'Arial font'.	Noted and done									
Page numbering Authors should number the pages of the manuscript.	Done									
Title: USEFULNESS OF ASCITIC FLUID CHOLESTEROL AND PROTEIN IN THE DIFFERENTIAL DIAGNOSIS OF ASCITES IN NIGERIA; ~~COMPARISM~~ COMPARISON WITH CONVENTIONAL CYTOLOGY.	Corrected									
Name of author 'Asterisks' should be attached to the name of the corresponding author.	Done									
Abstract Aim:" malignant group in ~~comparism~~ comparison with cytology."	Corrected									
Ethical approval - Authors should insert the ethical approval number. " ethical approval (approval number) was given by the Health Research and Ethics Committee of the Lagos University Teaching Hospital". - Authors should insert the following declaration in this manuscript "This study have been examined and approved by the appropriate ethics committee and have therefore been performed in accordance with the ethical standards laid down in the 1964 declaration of Helsinki."	Inserted Inserted									
Duration of Study cum Study Area "This study was carried out between August 2011 and July 2013. " "This was between August 2011 and February 2012. " Authors should harmonize these inconsistencies in study duration.	Noted									
Laboratory Analysis "Cytology was done using ~~papanicolaou~~ Papanicolaou and Giemsa stained ed smears." " sediments of centrifuged ascitic fluid (at rpm)....."	Corrected									
Cytology The author(s) should present, side by side in the result section, photomicrographs of stained typical malignant slide and non-malignant slides from their study for comparison.	Inserted									
Result This probably may be due to the fact that this study was ~~done~~ carried out in a Western Nigerian State, notably dominated by the Yoruba tribe. a Yoruba – dominated area.	Corrected									
Figures Authors should give suitable titles to the figures in the manuscript. The titles should be placed beneath the figures.	Done									
Table Authors should remove the border lines within the table 1. All tables should be formatted to look like the table below: Table 1: Receiver operating characteristic (roc) curve analysis of ascitic fluid variables <table><tr><th>Ascitic fluid analyte</th><th>Area under the curve</th><th>P-value</th></tr><tr><td>Protein</td><td>0.629</td><td>P = 0.061</td></tr><tr><td>Cholesterol</td><td>0.989</td><td>P <0.001*</td></tr></table>	Ascitic fluid analyte	Area under the curve	P-value	Protein	0.629	P = 0.061	Cholesterol	0.989	P <0.001*	Done
Ascitic fluid analyte	Area under the curve	P-value								
Protein	0.629	P = 0.061								
Cholesterol	0.989	P <0.001*								
Authors should rephrase the title of table 4 to make more meaning.	Done									

Conclusion What is the authors' conclusion on the usefulness of protein in ascites? Limitations If this "study has been able to demonstrate a strong relationship between ascitic fluid cholesterol and malignancy", how is the "relative small sample size" a limitation? Authors should present logical and coherent limitations, if this part is actually necessary. Authors' contributions Authors may use the following wordings for this section: " 'Author A' designed the study, performed the statistical analysis, wrote the protocol, and wrote the first draft of the manuscript. 'Author B' and 'Author C' managed the analyses of the study. 'Author C' managed the literature searches..... All authors read and approved the final manuscript." Referencing In the text, citations should be indicated by the reference number in brackets [3]. For example: "Ascites is defined as the abnormal accumulation of fluid in the peritoneal cavity [1]. The etiology of ascites is multifactorial and the pathophysiology varies depending on its etiology [2,3]." Journal names should be abbreviated and unitalicized, and all abbreviations should be those found in the NCBI databases (Link: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/nlmcatalog/journals).	It has been included Corrected Done Done
---	--