



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	International Research Journal of Pure and Applied Chemistry
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012 IRJPAC 2600
Title of the Manuscript:	A comparative study on the use of Calcium Acetate Lactate, Calcium chloride and Acidic Ammonium Acetate- Ethylene Diaminetetra acetic acid (AAAc-EDTA) for the quantification of extractable, P, K and Mg from acidic soils.

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	In the abstract it is reported that for Mg, the CaCl₂ method extracted just about a half of what was extracted using AAAC-EDTA method. However, according to the results shown in Table 1, the opposite occurs. The average Mg extracted by the CaCl₂ method (76.0 mg / kg) is twice that achieved with the AAAC-EDTA method (38.5). This fact changes the whole discussion. It is essential that the results are consistent with the discussion. It is strongly recommended that the authors review the data and / or discussion of the results.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	In Material and Methods section, the description of the methods used for the elements determination are confused. It is recommended a writing clearer, perhaps using a table for description.	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	The article is quite interesting from the methodological point of view, since it discusses the use of a single extraction method for different elements, minimizing the time, cost of reagents and laboratory work.	



SDI Review Form 1.6

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Marcela Guiotoku.
Department, University & Country	Soil Laboratory, Brazilian Agricultural Reserach Company (EMBRAPA), Brazil.