



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                              |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Research Journal of Pure and Applied Chemistry</a> |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2015_IRJPAC_16319                                                            |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Volatile constituents from the leaves of Pachira aquatica Aubl               |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                    |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p><b>I suggest some modifications to the manuscripts, as follows:</b></p> <p><b>(i) Please specify the possible applicative use of the knowledge this research could have. As the plant is used for ornamental purposes only, what is the utility of describing the chemical volatile composition of its essential oil?</b></p> <p><b>(ii) In section 2.1, please indicate how many plants were considered, the date when leaves were collected (as well as the phenological stage, if possible), and the amount of leaves samples (for example, 1 kg).</b></p> <p><b>(iii) Section 2.3 and 2.4. Is there a published method for this protocol of analysis? Or is it an in-house method?</b></p> <p><b>(iv) For section 2.5. The authors did not use pure reference compounds, which could represent a lack on this research. By the way, due to the explorative aim of the experiment, and the fact that it could be considered as a preliminary research, that must be followed by others, if relevant, I consider that it could be considered adequate.</b></p> <p><b>(v) For Results and Discussion section: I would suggest to authors to report about fatty acids and volatile compounds separately, and also to discuss better the results and the difference found from their results with respect to other similar published papers. For example, the biochemical origin</b></p> | <p>(i) Although the plant is grown for ornamental purpose in Nigeria, however, the medicinal importance of the plant could be seen in Paragraph. Further research works are on to determine the biological activities of both the extracts and essential oils samples</p> <p>(ii) The collection was made by picking leaves from plants growing at the garden. Only the weight of the air-dried sample was taken. Mature leaves samples were collected.</p> <p>(iii) There is no established protocol for the analysis. Each laboratory has developed overtime an accurate analytical conditions based on the expected product and the nature of GC, GC/MS, detector etc</p> <p>(iv) Pure reference compound to the best of our knowledge may be useful in case where the GC and GC/MS were not well resolved.</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|--|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p><b>of these compounds and the factors that could influence their concentrations.</b></p> <p>(vi) It is a work very similar to a published paper (<a href="https://www.jstage.jst.go.jp/article/jos/63/6/63_ess13179/pdf">https://www.jstage.jst.go.jp/article/jos/63/6/63_ess13179/pdf</a>) where the only change is the different variety of the plant (P. glabra and not P. aquatica), and in this case authors did not study microbiological effects. I believe that this is not a plagiarism, and I also hope that the authors are the same or belong to the same laboratory.</p> | <p>(v) To our knowledge, we normally report the constituents of an essential based on the major and minor components regardless of the classes of compounds they belong. Consideration will only be given to the suggested alteration when study on chemotaxonomy is involved. The present and previous data are not considerable enough for such classification. However, we added some information in accordance with the suggestion</p> <p>(vi) we are convinced by what we have done. We are providing a pdf file of our previous article mentioned by the reviewer for him to be able to cross check for the information on the present and previous articles, so as to nullify the effect of plagiarism levelled against our personality. Research findings are subjected to various conditions such as time, availability of resources etc and this may affect the focus and output of a researcher at different</p> |
|--|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                    |
|-----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------|
|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | stage.                                             |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   | Please check the manuscript, where I highlighted some parts.<br>Please also check the English and other spelling/typing mistakes.                                                                                                                                                                                            | We have made correction to the best of our ability |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | The paper is a very short and concise report about the volatile compounds analysed from the leaf of a plant, that is scarcely known in literature. This seem the first report on this plant in Nigeria.<br>I would suggest the authors to add this information in the title ("cultivated in Nigera", or "grown in Nigeria"). | Information included as desired.                   |