



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Physical Science International Journal
Manuscript Number:	2014_PSIJ_13453
Title of the Manuscript:	Nano-structural characterizations: Elongation of graphene layers within solid hydrocarbons
Type of the Article	Original research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
All authors' responses are accepted except for the one for Section 4.2. Despite that all functional groups are labelled accordingly, the band =C-H is still impossible to be observed from all spectra as there are no obvious peak corresponding to 3020 cm ⁻¹ . I doubt the validity of the Mid-IR spectra. Please convince me with more evidence.	<p>In HAC, the 3020 cm⁻¹ band is generally weak when the structure of HAC is dominated by aliphatic structures (Mennella et al. 1995,444:288.; Jäger et al. 2008,689:249; and Dischler, B., 1987;17:189). This band appears remarkably in some samples (S7, S15 and S16) although it seems very weak in S16 relative to the aliphatic -C-H bands and sometimes it disappears as in case of S8 but, with heat treatments of the same sample, it appears at 200 and 434 °C as shown in Figure 6.</p> <p>With heating when the transformation from aliphatic to aromatic structure occurs and HAC becomes dominated aromatic structures, it becomes very stronger relative to the aliphatic -C-H structures in the CH stretching region (Goto et al. 2000, A&AS, 141, 149.; Goto et al. 2003, ApJ 589, 419).</p> <p>A brief two statements have been added in the text. Please see the highlighted yellow parts in Section 4.2 and 4.3.</p>