



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<b><u>Physical Science International Journal</u></b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>2014_PSIJ_9390</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Spectral Discrimination of Coral Reefs on the Small Islands,Spermonde Archipelago, Indonesia</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments	<p>This manuscript presents a work describing an important finding of spectral discrimination of coral reefs in Indonesia. Although the results presented in this manuscript are important for coral reef community to determine the spectral characteristics of living and dead corals, the study overall fails to establish the findings, contains a number of results and data presentation problems, that preclude its recommendation for publication in present form. However, a major revision is needed in clarifying and improvement the manuscript.</p> <p>The results and discussion are not clearly presented in the manuscript. The authors described their results and discussion together once and again they discussed separately, it's a big discussion but not clearly conclude the results. One of the most important portions are algae they have been described in the manuscript but they couldn't identify any algae. What species of algae are involved to cover dead/rubber corals. They mentioned in the abstract "The samples comprised living and dead coral covered with alga and coral rubber covered with algae". What alga and what kinds of algae are actually involved. As they mentioned that single alga and algae, it should be clearly discussed and identify the species and which area covered by single alga and which are not.</p> <p>Also it is important to identify species (algae) because it is reported that some species of algae are resist the coral reefs from ocean acidification. If not possible, then author should discussed clearly why not.</p> <p>The results is not clearly mentioned in the figure legends, e.g., fig 2.</p> <p>Overall, the conclusion is difficult to understand for reader.</p>	
<b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments		
<b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments		

**Reviewer Details:**

<b>Name:</b>	<b>Azizur Rahman,</b>
<b>Department, University &amp; Country</b>	<b>Department of Chemical and Physical Sciences, University of Toronto, Canada</b>