



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Physical Science International Journal
Manuscript Number:	2014_PSIJ_12576
Title of the Manuscript:	Electron energy levels for a finite elliptical quantum wire in a transverse magnetic field
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The authors need to explain why the Zeeman term is not taken into account in their Hamiltonian given the presence of the magnetic field. 2. Eq.2 is not an Eigenvalue problem, therefore inserting eq.9 in eq.2 cannot lead to eq.11 as claimed in line 114. 3. Eq.10 needs to be justified more explicitly, given that it does not have the form of the exact solution to the Hamiltonian Eigen value problem within the present setting. In addition, the parameter alpha in eq.10 which apparently should influence the energy levels is neither defined nor the values used for it in the numerical calculations stated. 	
Minor REVISION comments	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The manuscript needs revision by a native speaker of English due to many grammatical errors. For instance lines 11 and 12 should read: ... decreases ... increases. Instead of ... decreased ... increasing. 2. A cross-section of the results reported here have been reported in the conference proceeding: Duan Xiu-Zhi; Wang Guang-Xin; Liu De; Gou Bing-Ping, "Electronic Structure of InAs/InP Elliptical Quantum Wires," <i>Photonics and Optoelectronics (SOPO)</i>, 2011 Symposium on , vol., no., pp.1,3, 16-18 May 2011 doi: 10.1109/SOPO.2011.5780629 <p>It would be appropriate to discuss the present results in comparison with the above work.</p>	
Optional/General comments		

Note: Anonymous Reviewer