

1

2 **Bianchi Type-IX Cosmological Model With**

3 **Perfect Fluid in $f(R)$ Theory of Gravity**

4 H. R. Ghate^{1*}, Atish S. Sontakke²

5 ^{1,2} Department of Mathematics, Jijamata Mahavidyalayya, Buldana (India) - 443001

6

7

8

9 **ABSTRACT**

Bianchi type-IX space-time is considered in the framework of $f(R)$ theory of gravity when the source for energy momentum tensor is perfect fluid. The cosmological model is obtained by using the condition that expansion scalar (θ) proportional to the shear scalar (σ). The physical and geometrical properties of the model are also discussed.

10

11 *Keywords: $f(R)$ gravity, Bianchi Type-IX space-time*

12

13 **1. INTRODUCTION**

14

15 Cosmological observations in the late 90's from different sources such as Cosmic

16 Microwave Background Radiations (CMBR) and Supernovae (SN Ia) surveys indicate that

17 the universe consist of 4% ordinary matter, 20% dark matter (DM) and 76% dark energy

18 (DE) [1-4]. The DE has large negative pressure while the pressure of DM is negligible. Wald

19 [5] has distinguished DM and DE and clarified that ordinary matter and DM satisfy the strong

20 energy conditions, whereas DE does not. The DE resembles with a cosmological constant

21 and scalar fields. The scalar field is provided by the dynamically changing DE including

22 quintessence, k-essence, tachyon, phantom, ghost condensate and quintom etc. The study

23 of high redshift supernova experiments [6-8], CMBR [9-10], Large scale structure [11] and

24 recent evidences from observational data [12-14] suggest that the universe is not only

25 expanding but also accelerating.

26 There are two major approaches according to the problem of accelerating

27 expansion. One is to introduce DE component in the universe and study its effects. Other

28 alternative is to modify general relativity termed as modified gravity approach. We are
29 interested in second one. After the introduction of General Relativity (GR) in 1915, questions
30 related to its limitations were in discussion. Einstein pointed out that Mach's principle is not
31 substantiated by general relativity. Several attempts have been made to generalize the
32 general theory of gravitation by incorporating Mach's principle and other desired features
33 which were lacking in the original theory. Alternative theories of gravitation have been
34 proposed to Einstein's theory to incorporate certain desirable features in the general theory.
35 In the last decades, as an alternative to general relativity, scalar tensor theories and
36 modified theories of gravitation have been proposed. The most popular amongst them are
37 Brans-Dicke [15], Nordtvedt [16], Sen [17], Sen and Dunn [18], Wagonar [19], Saez-Ballester
38 [20] etc. Recently, $f(R)$ gravity and $f(R,T)$ gravity theories have much importance
39 amongst the modified theories of gravity because these theories are supposed to provide
40 natural gravitational alternative to dark energy. Amongst the various modifications, $f(R)$
41 theory of gravity is treated most suitable due to cosmologically important $f(R)$ models. In
42 $f(R)$ gravity, the Lagrangian density f is an arbitrary function of R [15, 21-23]. The model
43 with $f(R)$ gravity can laid to the accelerated expansion of the universe. A generalization of
44 $f(R)$ modified theory of gravity was proposed by Takahashi and Soda [24] by including
45 explicit coupling of an arbitrary function of the Ricci Scalar R with the matter Lagrangian
46 density L_m . There are two formalism in deriving field equations from the action in $f(R)$
47 gravity. The first is the standard metric formalism in which the field equations are derived by
48 the variation of the action with respect to the metric tensor $g_{\mu\nu}$. The second is the Palatini
49 formalism. Maeda [25] have investigated Palatini formulation of the non-minimal geometry-
50 coupling models. Multamaki and Vilja [26] obtained spherically symmetric solutions of
51 modified field equations in $f(R)$ theory of gravity. Akbar and Cai [27] studied $f(R)$ theory
52 of gravity action is a nonlinear function of the curvature scalar R . Nojiri and Odinstove [28-
53 30] derived that a unification of the early time inflation and late time acceleration is allowed in
54 $f(R)$ theory. Ananda, Carloni and Dunsby [31] studied structure growth in $f(R)$ theory
55 with dust equation of state. Sharif and Shamir [32] and Sharif [33] have studied the vacuum
56 solutions of Bianchi type-I, V and VI space-times. Sharif and Shamir [34] and Sharif and
57 Kausar [35] obtained the non-vacuum solutions of Bianchi type-I, III and V space-times in
58 $f(R)$ theory of gravity. Adhav [36, 37] have investigated Kantowski-Sachs string
59 cosmological model and Bianchi type-III cosmological model with perfect fluid in $f(R)$
60 gravity. Singh and Singh [38] have obtained functional form of $f(R)$ with power-law

61 expansion in Bianchi type-I space-times. Recently Jawad and Chattopadhyay [39] have
 62 investigated new holographic dark energy in $f(R)$ Horava Lifshitz gravity. Rahman et al.
 63 [40] have obtained non-commutative wormholes in $f(R)$ gravity with Lorentzian distribution.

64 Motivated by the above investigations, in this paper an attempt is made to study
 65 Bianchi type-IX space-time when universe is filled with perfect fluid in $f(R)$ theory of gravity
 66 with standard metric formalism. Bianchi type-IX space-time are of vital importance in
 67 describing cosmological models at the early stages of evolution of the universe. This work is
 68 organized as follows: In Section 2, $f(R)$ gravity formalism is presented. In Section 3, the
 69 model and field equations have been presented. The field equations have been solved in
 70 Section 4. The physical and geometrical behaviors of the two models have been discussed
 71 in Section 5. In Section 6, concluding remarks have been expressed.

72

73 2. $f(R)$ GRAVITY FORMALISM:

74

75 The action $f(R)$ gravity is given by

$$76 \quad S = \int \sqrt{-g} \left(\frac{1}{16\pi G} f(R) + L_m \right) d^4x. \quad (1)$$

77 Here $f(R)$ is a general function of the Ricci scalar R and L_m is the matter Lagrangian.

78 The corresponding field equations of the $f(R)$ gravity are found by varying the action with
 79 respect to the metric $g_{\mu\nu}$:

$$80 \quad F(R)R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2}f(R)g_{\mu\nu} - \nabla_\mu \nabla_\nu F(R) + g_{\mu\nu} \square F(R) = kT_{\mu\nu}, \quad (2)$$

81 where $F(R) = \frac{d}{dR}f(R)$, $\square \equiv \nabla^\mu \nabla_\mu$, ∇_μ is the covariant derivative and $T_{\mu\nu}$ is the standard

82 matter energy-momentum tensor derived from the Lagrangian L_m .

83 Taking trace of the above equation (with $k=1$), we obtain

$$84 \quad F(R)R - 2f(R) + 3\square F(R) = T. \quad (3)$$

85 On simplification, equation (3) leads to

$$86 \quad f(R) = \frac{F(R)R + 3\nabla^\mu \nabla_\mu F - T}{2}. \quad (4)$$

87

88 **3. METRIC AND FIELD EQUATIONS:**

89

90 Bianchi type-IX metric is considered in the form,

91
$$ds^2 = -dt^2 + a^2 dx^2 + b^2 dy^2 + (b^2 \sin^2 y + a^2 \cos^2 y) dz^2 - 2a^2 \cos y dx dz, \quad (5)$$

92 where a, b are scale factors and are functions of cosmic time t .

93 The Ricci scalar for Bianchi type-IX model is given by

94
$$R = -2 \left[\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} + 2 \frac{\ddot{b}}{b} + 2 \frac{\dot{a}\dot{b}}{ab} + \frac{\dot{b}^2}{b^2} + \frac{1}{b^2} - \frac{a^2}{4b^4} \right]. \quad (6)$$

95 **The energy momentum tensor for the perfect fluid is given by**

96
$$T_{ij} = (\rho + p)u_i u_j - p g_{ij}, \quad (7)$$

97 **satisfying the barotropic equation of state**

98
$$p = \gamma \rho, \quad 0 \leq \gamma \leq 1, \quad (8)$$

99 where ρ is the energy density and p is the pressure of the fluid.

100 **In co-moving coordinate system**

101
$$T_1^1 = T_2^2 = T_3^3 = -p, \quad T_4^4 = \rho, \quad T = \rho - 3p. \quad (9)$$

102 **With the help of equations (7) to (9), the field equations (2) for the metric (5) are**

103
$$\left(\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} + 2 \frac{\ddot{b}}{b} \right) F + \frac{1}{2} f(R) + \left(\frac{\dot{a}}{a} + 2 \frac{\dot{b}}{b} \right) \dot{F} = -\rho, \quad (10)$$

104
$$\left(\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} + 2 \frac{\dot{a}\dot{b}}{ab} + \frac{a^2}{2b^4} \right) F + \frac{1}{2} f(R) + \ddot{F} + 2 \frac{\dot{b}}{b} \dot{F} = p, \quad (11)$$

105
$$\left(\frac{\ddot{b}}{b} + \frac{\dot{b}^2}{b^2} + \frac{\dot{a}\dot{b}}{ab} + \frac{1}{b^2} - \frac{a^2}{2b^4} \right) F + \frac{1}{2} f(R) + \ddot{F} + \left(\frac{\dot{a}}{a} + \frac{\dot{b}}{b} \right) \dot{F} = p, \quad (12)$$

106 where the overdot ($\dot{}$) denotes the differentiation with respect to t .

107

108 **4. SOLUTIONS OF FIELD EQUATIONS:**

109

110 **The field equations (10) to (12) are highly non-linear differential equations in five**
111 **unknowns a, b, p, ρ, F . Hence to obtain a determinate solution of the system we take the**
112 **expansion scalar (θ) is proportional to the shear scalar (σ) (Collin et al. [41]), which leads**
113 **to**

114
$$a = b^m, \quad (m \neq 1), \quad (13)$$

115 where m is proportionality constant.

116 Also the power law relation between scale factor (A) and scalar field (F) [37, 42-43] has
117 been given by

$$118 \quad F \propto A^n, \quad (14)$$

119 where n is arbitrary constant and A is average scale factor.

120 Equation (14) leads to

$$121 \quad F = K A^n, \quad (15)$$

122 where K is proportionality constant.

123 With the help of equation (13), equation (15) reduces to

$$124 \quad F = K b^{\frac{(m+2)n}{3}}. \quad (16)$$

125 Subtraction of equation (10) from (11), (10) from (12) respectively and dividing the result by
126 F gives

$$127 \quad 2 \frac{\dot{a} \dot{b}}{a b} - 2 \frac{\ddot{b}}{b} + \frac{a^2}{2b^4} + \frac{\ddot{F}}{F} - \frac{\dot{a} \dot{F}}{a F} = \frac{p + \rho}{F}, \quad (17)$$

$$128 \quad \frac{\dot{a} \dot{b}}{a b} - \frac{\ddot{a}}{a} - \frac{\ddot{b}}{b} + \frac{\dot{b}^2}{b^2} + \frac{1}{b^2} - \frac{a^2}{2b^4} + \frac{\ddot{F}}{F} - \frac{\dot{b} \dot{F}}{b F} = \frac{p + \rho}{F}. \quad (18)$$

129 Subtraction of equation (18) from equation (17) yields

$$130 \quad \frac{\ddot{a}}{a} - \frac{\ddot{b}}{b} + \frac{\dot{a} \dot{b}}{a b} - \frac{\dot{a} \dot{F}}{a F} + \frac{\dot{b} \dot{F}}{b F} - \frac{1}{b^2} - \frac{\dot{b}^2}{b^2} + \frac{a^2}{b^4} = 0. \quad (19)$$

131 With the help of equation (13) and (16), equation (19) leads to

$$132 \quad \frac{\ddot{b}}{b} + \frac{(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3) \dot{b}^2}{3(m-1)b^2} - \frac{1}{(m-1)b^2} + \frac{b^{2m-4}}{(m-1)} = 0. \quad (20)$$

133 On simplification, equation (20) reduces to

$$134 \quad \frac{d}{db}(\dot{b}^2) + \frac{2(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)}{3(m-1)b}(\dot{b}^2) = \frac{1}{(m-1)}(2b^{-2} - 2b^{2m-3}). \quad (21)$$

135 Integrating equation (21)

$$136 \quad \dot{b} = \sqrt{\frac{3}{(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} - \frac{3}{(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} b^{2(m-1)}}. \quad (22)$$

137 Using equations (13) and (22), equation (5) reduces to

$$138 \quad ds^2 = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} - \left[\frac{1}{\left(\frac{3}{(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} - \frac{3}{(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} \right) b^{2(m-1)}} \right] db^2 \\ + b^{2m} dx^2 + b^2 dy^2 + (b^2 \sin^2 y + b^{2m} \cos^2 y) dz^2 - 2b^{2m} \cos y dx dz \end{array} \right\} .(23)$$

139 Using transformations $b = T, x = X, y = Y, z = Z$, equation (23) leads to

$$140 \quad ds^2 = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} - \left[\frac{1}{\left(\frac{3}{(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} - \frac{3}{(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} \right) T^{2(m-1)}} \right] dT^2 \\ + T^{2m} dX^2 + T^2 dY^2 + (T^2 \sin^2 Y + T^{2m} \cos^2 Y) dZ^2 - 2b^{2m} \cos Y dX dZ \end{array} \right\} .(24)$$

141

142 5. SOME PHYSICAL PROPERTIES OF THE MODEL:

143

144 For the cosmological model (24), the physical quantities spatial volume V , Hubble
145 parameter H , expansion scalar θ , mean anisotropy parameter A_m , shear scalar σ^2 ,
146 energy density ρ are obtained as follows:

147 Spatial volume,

$$148 \quad V = T^{m+2}. \quad (25)$$

149 Hubble parameter,

$$150 \quad H = \frac{(m+2)}{3T} \left(\frac{3}{(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} - \frac{3}{(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} T^{2(m-1)} \right)^{1/2}. \quad (26)$$

151 Expansion scalar,

$$152 \quad \theta = \frac{(m+2)}{T} \left(\frac{3}{(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} - \frac{3}{(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} T^{2(m-1)} \right)^{1/2}. \quad (27)$$

153 Mean Anisotropy Parameter,

$$154 \quad A_m = \frac{2(m-1)^2}{(m+2)^2} = \text{constant} (\neq 0 \text{ for } m \neq 1). \quad (28)$$

155 Shear scalar,

$$156 \quad \sigma^2 = \left\{ \frac{(m-1)^2}{(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} T^{-2} - \frac{(m-1)^2}{(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} T^{2(m-2)} \right\}. \quad (29)$$

$$157 \quad \frac{\sigma^2}{\rho^2} = \frac{(m-1)^2}{3(m+2)^2} = \text{constant} (\neq 0), \text{ for } m \neq 1. \quad (30)$$

158 Using equations (8), (16) and (22) in equation (10), the energy density is obtained as

$$159 \quad \rho = \frac{K}{2(1+\gamma)} T^{\frac{m+2n-6}{3}} \left(\begin{array}{l} 1 + \frac{9(1+4m-m^2) + (mn+2n)(2mn-3m+4n-9)}{3(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} \\ \left[\frac{9(1+4m-m^2)}{3(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} + \frac{(mn+2n-3m+3)(2mn-3m+4n-9)}{3(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} \right] T^{2(m-1)} \end{array} \right). \quad (31)$$

160 From equation (6) we obtain

$$161 \quad R = \left(\begin{array}{l} \left[1 + \frac{3(1+m+m^2)}{(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} \right] - \left[\frac{3(1+m+m^2)}{(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} + \frac{2(m+3)}{2(m-1)} \right] \\ \left[\frac{2(m+2)(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)}{(m-1)(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} \right] T^{2(m-2)} \end{array} \right). \quad (32)$$

162 From equation (4) the function of Ricci scalar $f(R)$ leads to

$$163 \quad f(R) = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \left[1 + \frac{3(1+4m-m^2) + (mn+2n)(mn+2n-3)}{(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} - \frac{(1-3\gamma)}{2(1+\gamma)} \right] \frac{K}{2} T^{\frac{(m+2)n-6}{3}} - \\ \left(\begin{array}{l} \left[1 + \frac{9(1+4m-m^2) + (mn+2n)(2mn-3m+4n-9)}{3(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)} \right] \\ \left[\frac{3(1+m+m^2) + (mn+2n)(mn+2n-3)}{(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} + \frac{(3m+9-2mn-4n)}{2(m-1)} \right. \\ \left. + \frac{(mn+2m+2n+4)(3m^2 - m^2n - mn + 2n - 3)}{(m-1)(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} \right] \frac{K}{2} T^{\frac{(m+2)n+6(m-2)}{3}} \\ \left. - \frac{(1-3\gamma)}{2(1+\gamma)} \left(\frac{9(1+4m-m^2) + (mn+2n-3m+3)(2mn-3m+4n-9)}{3(6m^2 - m^2n - mn - 6m + 2n)} \right) \right] \end{array} \right\} \quad (33)$$

164 ,
165 which clearly indicates that $f(R)$ is written in terms of T , which is true as $f(R)$ depends
166 upon T .

167 By inserting the value of R from equation (32) in equation (33), $f(R)$ reduces to a function
168 of R .

169 For a special case when $m = n = 2$, $f(R)$ turns out to be

$$f(R) = \frac{K}{3(1+\gamma)} \left(\frac{88}{59+4R} \right) \left[-41+15\gamma + \frac{220(2-3\gamma)}{59+4R} \right]. \quad (34)$$

171 This gives $f(R)$ only as a function of R .

172

173 6. CONCLUSION:

174

175 Bianchi type-IX cosmological model have been obtained when universe is filled with perfect
176 fluid in $f(R)$ theory of gravity. The model obtained has singularity at $T = 0$ and the physical

177 parameters H , θ , σ^2 are infinite at $T = 0$ as well. It is observed that the scale factors and
178 volume of the model vanishes at initial epoch and increases with the passage of time
179 representing expanding universe. From equation (26) and (28) the mean anisotropy

180 parameter A_m is constant and $\frac{\sigma^2}{\theta^2} (\neq 0)$ is also constant, hence the model is anisotropic

181 throughout the evolution of the universe except at $m = 1$ i.e. the model does not approach
182 isotropy.

183 It is worth to mention that, the model obtained is point type singular, expanding, shearing,
184 non-rotating and does not approach isotropy for large T . We hope that our model will be
185 useful in the study of structure formation in the early universe and an accelerating expansion
186 of the universe at present.

187

188 REFERENCES:

189

190 1. Astier P, Guy N, Regnault R, Pain R, Aubourg E, Balam D et al., The supernova legacy
191 survey: measurement of Ω_M , Ω_Λ and w from the first year dataset. *Astronomy &*
192 *Astrophysics*.2006;447(1):31-48.

193

194 2. Eisenstein DJ, Zehavi I, Hogg DW, Scoccimarro R., Blanton MR, Nichol RC et al.,
195 Detection of the baryon acoustic peak in the large-scale correlation function of SDSS
196 luminous red galaxies. *Astrophysical Journal* 2005;663(2):560-574.

197

198 3. Riess AG, Strolger LG, Tonry J, Casertano S, Ferguson HC, Mobasher B, et al. Type Ia
199 Supernova Discoveries at $z > 1$ from the Hubble Space Telescope: Evidence for the Past
200 Deceleration and Constraints on Dark Energy Evolution. *The Astrophysical Journal*, 2004;
201 607(2):665-678. [doi:10.1086/383612](https://doi.org/10.1086/383612)

202

203 4. Spergel DN, Bean R, Dore O, Nolta MR, Bennett CL, Dunkley J et al. Three-
204 Year Wilkinson Microwave Anisotropy Probe (WMAP) Observations: Implications for
205 cosmology. *Astrophysical Journal Supplementary Series*. 2007;170(2):377-408.
206 [doi:10.1086/513700](https://doi.org/10.1086/513700)

207

208 5. Wald RM, *General Relativity*. 1984 Chicago University Press, Chicago.

209

210 6. Riess AG, Filippenko AV, Challis P, Clocchiatti A, Diercks A, Garnavich PM, et al.
211 Observational Evidence from super-novae for an Accelerating Universe and a Cosmological
212 Constant. *The Astrophysical Journal*. 1998;116(3):1009-1038. [doi:10.1086/300499](https://doi.org/10.1086/300499)

213

214 7. Perlmutter S, Aldering G, Goldhaber G, Knop RA, Nugent P, Castro PG, et al.
215 Measurement of and 42 high-Redshift Supernovae. *The Astrophysical Journal*. 1999;
216 517(2):565-586. [doi:10.1086/307221](https://doi.org/10.1086/307221)

217

218 8. Bennett CL, Halpern M, Hinshaw G, Jarosik N, Kogur A, Limon M, et al. First-
219 Year Wilkinson Microwave Anisotropy Probe (WMAP) Observations: Preliminary Maps and
220 Basic Results. *Astrophysical Journal Supplementary Series*. 2003; 148(1):1-27.
221 [doi:10.1086/377253](https://doi.org/10.1086/377253)

222

223 9. Spergel DN, Verde L, Peiris HV, Komatsu E, Nolta MR, Bennett CL, et al. First-
224 Year Wilkinson Microwave Anisotropy Probe (WMAP) Observations: Determinations of
225 cosmological parameters. *Astrophysical Journal Supplementary Series*. 2003; 148(1):175.
226 [doi:10.1086/377226](https://doi.org/10.1086/377226)

227

228 10. Tegmark M, Strauss MA, Blanton MR, Abazajian K, Dodelson S, Sandvik H, et al.
229 Cosmological parameters from SDSS and WMAP. *Physical Review D*. 2004;
230 69(10):103501. [doi: 10.1103/PhysRevD.69.103501](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.69.103501).

231

232 11. Spergel DN, Bean R, Dore O, Nolta MR, Bennett CL, Dunkley J et al. Three-
233 Year Wilkinson Microwave Anisotropy Probe (WMAP) Observations: Implications for
234 cosmology. *Astrophysical Journal Supplementary Series*. 2007;170(2):377-408.
235 [doi:10.1086/513700](https://doi.org/10.1086/513700)

236

- 237 12. Oppenheimer JR, Snyder H. On continued gravitational contraction. Physical Review.
238 1939;56:455.
239
- 240 13. Penrose R. Gravitational collapse:The role of general relativity. Riv. Nuovo Cimento.
241 1969; 1:252-276.
242
- 243 14. Penrose R. Golden Oldie: Gravitational collapse: The role of general relativity. Gen. Rel.
244 Grav. 2002; 34(7):1141-1165.
245
- 246 15. Brans CH, Dicke RH. Machs principle and a relativistic theory of gravitation. Physical
247 Review. 1961; 124:925-935.
248
- 249 16. Nordtvedt K Jr. Post-Newtonian metric for a general class of scalar-tensor gravitational
250 theories and observational consequences. Astrophysical Journal. 1970; 161:1059-1067.
251
- 252 17. Sen DK. A static cosmological models. Z. Fur Phys. 1957; 149:311-323.
253
- 254 18. Sen DK, Dunn KA. A scalar-tensor theory of gravitation in a modified Riemannian
255 manifold. J. Math. Phys. 1971; 12(4):578-586.
256
- 257 19. Wagoner RT. Scalar-tensor theory of gravitational waves. Physical Review D. 1970;
258 1(12):3209-3216.
259
- 260 20. Saez D, Ballester VJ. A simple coupling with cosmological implications. Physics letters
261 A. 1985; 113(9):467-470.
262
- 263 21. Breizman BN, Gurovich VT, Sokolov VP. The possibility of setting up regular
264 cosmological solutions. Zh. Eksp. Teor. Fiz. 1970; 59:288-294.
265
- 266 22. Buchdahl HA. Non-linear Lagrangians and cosmological theory. Mon. Not. Roy. Astr.
267 Soc. 1970; 150:1.
268
- 269 23. Ruzmaikina TV, Ruzmaikin AA. Quadratic corrections to the lagrangian density of the
270 gravitational field and the singularity. Zh. Eksp. Teor. Fiz. 1969;57:680-685.
271

- 272 24. Takahashi T, Soda J. Master equations for gravitational perturbations of static lovelock
273 black holes in higher dimensios. Progress of Theoretical Physics. 2010; 124:91.
274
- 275 25. Maeda M. Final fate of spherically symmetric gravitational collapse of a dust cloud in
276 Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity. Physical Review D. 2006;73:104004.
277
- 278 26. Multamaki T, Vilja I. Spherically symmetric solutions of modified field equations in $f(R)$
279 theories of gravity. Physical Review D. 2006; 74:064022.
280
- 281 27. Akbar M, Cai RG. Friedmann equatiions of FRW universe in scalar-tensor gravity, $f(R)$
282 gravity and first law of thermodynamics. Physics Letters B. 2006; 635:7
283
- 284 28. Nojiri S, Odinstov SD. Introduction to modified gravity and gravitational alternative for
285 dark energy. Int. J. Geom. Meth. Mod. Phys. 2007; 4:115-146.
286
- 287 29. Nojiri S and Odinstov SD. Unifying inflation with Λ CDM epoch in modified $F(R)$ gravity
288 consistent with solar system tests. Physics Letters B. 2007;657:238-245.
289
- 290 30. Nojiri S, Odinstov SD. Future evolution and finite-time singularities in $F(R)$ gravity
291 unifying inflation and cosmic acceleration. Phys. Rev. D. 2008; 78:046006.
292
- 293 31. Ananda KN, Carloni S, Dunsby PKS. Structure growth in $f(R)$ theory with dust
294 equation of state. Clas. Quant. Grav. 2009; 26:235018.
295
- 296 32. Sharif M, Shamir MF, The vacuum solutions of Bianchi type-I, V and VI space-times.
297 Class. Quant. Grav. 2009;26:235020.
298
- 299 33. Shamir MF. Plane symmetric vacuum Bianchi type III cosmology in $f(R)$ gravity.
300 International J. Theore. Phys. 2011; 50:637-643.
301
- 302 34. Sharif M, Shamir MF. Non-vacuum Bianchi types I and V in $f(R)$ gravity. Gen. Relat.
303 Grav. 2010; 42: 2643-2655.
304
- 305 35. Sharif M, Kausar HR. Non-vacuum solutions of Bianchi type VI universe in $f(R)$ gravity.
306 Astrophys. Spac. Sci. 2011; 332:463-471.

307

308 **36.** Adhav KS. Kantowski-Sachs string cosmological model in $f(R)$ theory of gravity. *Can. J.*
309 *Phys.* 2012; 90:119-123.

310

311 **37.** Adhav KS. Bianchi Type-III cosmological model in $f(R)$ theory of gravity. *Res. J. Sci.*
312 *Tech.* 2013; 5(1):85-91.

313

314 **38.** Singh V, Singh CP. Functional form of $f(R)$ with power-law expansion in anisotropic
315 model. *Astrophysics and Space science.* 2013; 346:285-289.

316

317 **39.** Jawad A, Chattopadhyay S, Pasqua A. New holographic dark energy in modified $f(R)$
318 Horava Lifshitz gravity. *Eur. Phys. J. Plus.* 2014; 51:129.

319

320 **40.** Rahaman F et al. Non-commutative wormholes in $f(R)$ gravity with Lorentzian
321 distribution. *Int. J. Theo. Phys.* 2014; 53:1910.

322

323 **41.** Collins C B, Glass E N, Wilkinson D A. Exact spatially homogeneous cosmologies. *Gen.*
324 *Relat. Grav.* 1980; 12(10):805-823.

325

326 **42.** Uddin K, Lidsey JE, Tavakol R. Cosmological perturbations in Palatini-modified gravity.
327 *Class. Quant. Grav.* 2007; 24:3951-3962.

328

329 **43.** Sharif M, Shamir MF. Exact vacuum solutions of Bianchi type-I and type-V space-times
330 in $f(R)$ theory of gravity. *Class. Quant. Grav.* 2009; 26:235020